



Scottish**Arts** Council

## **Sharing the spotlight**

Increasing Access and  
Participation in the Arts by  
Scotland's Minority Ethnic Communities

Gina Netto, Andrew Patrizio,  
Sophie Pilgrim and Martin MacEwen

A report for the Scottish Arts Council

Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit/  
edinburgh college of art

February 2003

**Scottish Arts Council**  
12 Manor Place, Edinburgh EH3 7DD

**Telephone** 0131 226 6051  
**Facsimile** 0131 225 9833  
**Help Desk** 0845 603 6000 (local rate)  
**E-mail** [help.desk@scottisharts.org.uk](mailto:help.desk@scottisharts.org.uk)  
**Website** [www.scottisharts.org.uk](http://www.scottisharts.org.uk)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>5</b>
1. POLITICAL AND SOCIAL CONTEXT	5
2. LEGISLATIVE CONTEXT	6
3. THE IMPACT OF THE SOCIAL INCLUSION AGENDA ON ARTS POLICIES	8
4. MINORITY ETHNIC POPULATION IN SCOTLAND	11
5. SCOPE AND AIMS OF THE RESEARCH	13
6. METHODOLOGY	14
7. STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT	17
8. TERMINOLOGY	17
<b>CHAPTER 2: PERSPECTIVES OF MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS</b>	<b>18</b>
1. ATTITUDES TOWARDS THE ARTS	18
2. ACCESS TO THE ARTS	20
3. PARTICIPATION IN THE ARTS	23
4. DISSEMINATION OF INFORMATION ABOUT ARTS EVENTS	25
5. KEY FINDINGS	26
<b>CHAPTER 3: PERSPECTIVES OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS</b>	<b>27</b>
1. BACKGROUND AND ACTIVITIES OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS	27
2. FUNDING	29
3. ARTS ASSOCIATED WITH MINORITY ETHNIC COMMUNITIES	31
4. PARTICIPANTS AND AUDIENCES	32
5. TRAINING IN ARTS-RELATED ACTIVITIES	33
6. LINKS AND COLLABORATION WITH OTHER ORGANISATIONS AND ARTISTS	33
7. PERCEPTIONS OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL	34
8. LINKS WITH LOCAL AUTHORITIES	35
9. VISION FOR THE FUTURE	35
10. KEY FINDINGS	36
<b>CHAPTER 4: PERSPECTIVES OF ARTISTS OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORIGIN</b>	<b>37</b>
1. BACKGROUND	37
2. CULTURAL IDENTITY AND ARTISTIC ACTIVITY	38
3. LINKS WITH ORGANISATIONS	39
4. WORKING AS AN ARTIST	40
5. PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT	41
6. CONTACT WITH THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AND PERCEPTION OF ITS ROLE	41
7. VISION FOR THE FUTURE	42
8. KEY FINDINGS	42
<b>CHAPTER 5: PERSPECTIVES OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS</b>	<b>43</b>
1. BACKGROUND	43
2. LOCAL AUTHORITIES' WORK WITHIN A CULTURALLY DIVERSE CONTEXT	43
3. LOCAL AUTHORITIES' PERCEPTIONS OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS	45
4. MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS' WORK WITHIN CULTURALLY DIVERSE CONTEXTS	46
5. MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS' LINKS WITH OTHER ORGANISATIONS	48
6. PERCEPTIONS OF AUDIENCE DEVELOPMENT BY LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS	49

7. TRAINING AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS	52
8. STRATEGIC CONTEXT OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS	52
9. LINKS WITH THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AND LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS	53
10. OTHER OBSERVATIONS	54
11. KEY FINDINGS	55
<b>CHAPTER 6: PERSPECTIVES FROM THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL</b>	<b>56</b>
1. BACKGROUND AND GENERAL VIEWS ABOUT THE DRAFT CULTURAL DIVERSITY POLICY	56
2. VIEWS ABOUT MAINSTREAMING	57
3. ROLE OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AS A FUNDING BODY	57
4. ROLE OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AS ADVOCATE	59
5. ROLE OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL IN PROVIDING A SUPPORTIVE INFRASTRUCTURE	59
6. REVIEW OF POLICY	60
7. COMMUNICATION OF POLICY TO OTHER ORGANISATIONS	62
8. LINKS WITH OTHER BODIES	62
9. CONCLUSION	63
10. KEY FINDINGS	64
<b>CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>65</b>
1. MAPPING AND PURPOSE OF ARTISTIC ACTIVITY	65
2. BARRIERS TO PARTICIPATION AND ATTENDANCE	65
3. ASPIRATION FOR MINORITY ETHNIC ARTS	66
4. KEY ISSUES FOR ARTS DEVELOPMENT	67
5. STRATEGIC LINKS AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR COLLABORATIVE WORKING	68
6. RECOMMENDATIONS	68
<b>APPENDICES:</b>	
1. TOPIC GUIDE FOR FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS	72
2. INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS	74
3. INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR ARTISTS OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORIGIN	79
4. INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR LOCAL AUTHORITY ARTS OFFICERS	84
5. INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR MAINSTREAM ORGANISATIONS	89
6. TOPIC GUIDE FOR FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL STAFF AND COMMITTEES	93
7. LETTER TO LOCAL AUTHORITIES	96

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Our warmest thanks go to all the participants of the focus group discussions and interviews which were organised for the study. The authors of the report would also like to acknowledge the valuable contribution of the advisory group to the project:

Jim Tough	Scottish Arts Council (Group Chair)
Kemi Adebayo	African Caribbean Cultural Association
Eliza Ma	Edinburgh Chinese Cultural Association
Clare Robertson	Scottish Academy of Asian Arts
Ehtisham Ullah Khan Shami	Pakistan Society
Dr. Rekha Gupta	East of Scotland Bengali Association
Pamela So	Artist
Brian McMaster	Edinburgh International Festival
Harminder Berman	Glasgow City Council
Neeru Bhatnagar	City of Edinburgh Council
Naseem Khan	Arts Council of England
Tanya Hutchinson	Scottish Arts Council
Anne Campbell	Scottish Arts Council

We are also grateful for the cooperation of the following individuals who helped to organise some of the focus group discussions: Kathy Miller (Edinburgh Chinese School), Nabirye Higenyi and Mino Das. Anja-Maaïke Green was largely responsible for the design of several interview frameworks. Karen Qureshi was involved in the initial stages of several aspects of the research, particularly in relation to the focus group discussions with minority ethnic communities.

We would also like to acknowledge the support of Jim Tough and Lindsay Lewis. Finally, many thanks go to Tanya Hutchinson, for her efficient and timely support throughout the study.

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

This chapter sets out the background and context within which the research was commissioned and conducted, and the purpose and methodology of the research. First, the political, social and legislative context is described. The recent development of arts policies in the context of the high prominence of social inclusion and social justice on the political agenda is also considered. The chapter also provides a brief description of the minority ethnic population in Scotland. The main aims and scope of the research is then outlined, followed by a description of the methodology employed. Finally, the chapter concludes by outlining the structure of the report, and describing the terminology which has been used.

### 1. POLITICAL AND SOCIAL CONTEXT

1.1 The Scottish Arts Council is currently developing a cultural diversity policy on the support of work by, with and for people from minority ethnic communities in Scotland. The aim of the policy is to ensure that the Scottish Arts Council has a collective and strategic approach to the support of this sector in Scotland. The outcome of the research is intended to inform the further development of the policy.

1.2 Several developments have raised the prominence of issues relating to the social inclusion of minority ethnic groups in Scotland over recent years. The Scottish Parliament has declared its commitment to social justice, social inclusion and equal opportunities to be at the core of its policies. It has also made a commitment to follow up the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry report through scrutiny of all public services for institutional racism, defined in the report as:

*The collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping which disadvantage minority ethnic people.<sup>1</sup> (Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report, 1999, para 6.34, p.28).*

The report also observed that it is incumbent upon every institution to examine its policies and the outcome of its policies and practices to guard against disadvantage in any section of our communities [para 46.27].

1.3 In July, 1999, A Race Equality Advisory Forum (REAF) chaired by the former Minister for Social Justice, Jackie Baillie, was also set up. This forum was to work in parallel with the Steering Group established to oversee the implementation of

---

<sup>1</sup> Macpherson, Sir W (1999) *The Stephen Lawrence Enquiry*, London: HMSO

the Scottish Executive's Action Plan<sup>2</sup> in response to the inquiry into the murder of Stephen Lawrence. REAF has recently produced a report of its work and identified areas for action to further race equality, as well as detailed action plans across a number of key policy areas.<sup>3</sup> A review of the Scottish Executive's Action Plan for Scotland has also recently been completed.<sup>4</sup>

- 1.4 Other developments have included the work of the Government's Social Exclusion Network (SEN) and the Scottish Social Inclusion Network (SSIN).
- 1.5 The Race Relations Act 1976 has also been significantly strengthened and extended by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 (the RRAA), which is considered more fully in the next section. REAF considers that the RRAA provides a legal framework for the mainstreaming of race equality and greater clarity to the public sector and those exercising public functions, as to the essential components of a mainstreaming approach.
- 1.6 'Mainstreaming' is defined as:

*'Making sure an equality perspective is part of the everyday work of government, involving policy matters across all government departments, as well as equality specialists and external partners.'* (Scottish Executive, 2001: 5<sup>5</sup>)

## **2. LEGISLATIVE CONTEXT**

- 2.1 The 1976 Race Relations Act is the key legislation in the UK that defines and outlaws racial discrimination. The Act provides for legal enforcement and establishes the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE) with wide-ranging powers relating to investigation, support for complainants, enforcement and periodic review of the Act itself. The CRE has conducted three reviews of the law with the last calling for some critical reforms.
- 2.2 The changes in the law effected by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, particularly the measures relating to the new positive duty placed on public authorities and those other agencies carrying out public functions, are in keeping with both the CRE recommendations and those of the Macpherson report.

---

<sup>2</sup> Scottish Executive (1999a) *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: An Action Plan for Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

<sup>3</sup> Scottish Executive (2001) *Race Equality Advisory Forum Report: Making it real: A race equality strategy for Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

<sup>4</sup> Scottish Executive (2001) *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: Review of Scottish Executive Action Plan – Review by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Group* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

<sup>5</sup> Scottish Executive, (2001) *Race Equality Advisory Forum Report: Making it real: A race equality strategy for Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

- 2.3 In common with all agencies providing a service to the public, or section of the public, the Scottish Arts Council must not discriminate unlawfully on racial grounds in the provision of such services by reason of s.21 of the Race Relations Act 1976. Similarly it must not discriminate in respect of its employment functions in terms of s.5. Racial grounds are defined as 'race, colour, nationality and national or racial origins'. Unlawful discrimination covers both direct discrimination - commonly but not necessarily accurately understood to cover deliberate acts or omissions - and indirect discrimination- frequently characterized, but again not entirely accurately, as unintended acts or omissions which are based on race.
- 2.4 Indirect discrimination occurs when a condition or requirement that is applied to everyone without distinction can only be met by a significantly smaller proportion of people from a particular racial group, who consequently are disadvantaged. The condition or requirement will be unlawful if it is not justifiable on non-racial grounds.
- 2.5 Section 1 of the 2000 Act adds a new section 19B to the 1976 Act. This requires all activities by public authorities to be non discriminatory; this includes activities previously excluded such as police powers of stop and search, the collection of taxes by the Inland Revenue and the inspection of residential care homes. In like manner, all the activities of the Scottish Arts Council will now require to be non-discriminatory; previously, the application of the act was restricted only to those authorities which provided a service, goods or facilities to the public or a section of the public. The Scottish Arts Council was not included in Schedule 1A of the 2000 Act which listed public agencies but the Home Office stated its intention to extend the list of agencies covered by subsequent order; and the Council is now included in the order.
- 2.6 Section 71 of the amended Act requires every body or other person specified in Schedule 1A or of a description falling within that Schedule to have due regard to the need:
- To eliminate unlawful discrimination
  - To promote equality of opportunity and good relations between persons of different racial groups
- 2.7 According to the CRE guidance (CRE, April, 2001) on this topic the aim of the general duty is to 'mainstream' elimination and promotion by making these an integral part of the way public functions are carried out.
- 2.8 Each public agency is expected to assess the likely impact of its policies in furthering compliance with the new obligations. While this will always be important in respect of employment, in some activities such as weather forecasting or air-traffic control, the likely impact of policies and practices are likely to be negligible. Each public agency is expected to provide a response which is proportionate to the likely impact of its policies.
- 2.9 In the case of the Scottish Arts Council the potential impact of policies and practices on both employment and services [or the provision of goods and facilities] is significant. The current exercise, along with the previous initiatives by

the Scottish Arts Council and the follow up, will be seen as making a substantial contribution to meeting the new obligations introduced by the RRA 2000.

- 2.10 Positive action may be used to comply with the general duty. The 1976 Act permits certain types of 'positive action', as described below. Public agencies are expected to consider how they might use these to promote racial equality:
- Measures to meet the special needs of a particular racial group (section 35)
  - Measures to make facilities or services available to people from a particular racial group in order to meet their education, training or welfare needs.
- 2.11 Some examples are provided below:
- An outreach scheme to encourage ethnic minority communities to be aware of services and support
  - Mobile services for Travellers or Gypsies or particular provision for refugees
  - Designated allocation of support to encourage take up by under-represented groups
  - Training and encouragement to tackle under-representation in employment (sections 37 and 38)
- 2.12 It is lawful to provide training for particular racial groups that are under-represented in certain types of work. The Act also allows employers and others to encourage applications for such jobs from under-represented racial groups. It remains unlawful, however, to discriminate in selecting people for the jobs. To apply a quota or to reserve jobs for under-represented racial groups is unlawful and must not be confused with lawful positive action measures. All schemes set up under sections 35, 37 or 38 must be regularly reviewed; if the special needs have been met, or the under-representation no longer exists, positive action may cease to be lawful.

### **3. THE IMPACT OF THE SOCIAL INCLUSION AGENDA ON ARTS POLICIES**

- 3.1 Efforts to increase cultural diversity in the arts are part of a wider development in Scottish arts policy making that seeks to increase access to the arts for all its population. There is also a parallel drive to support artists from increasingly diverse social, economic and cultural backgrounds and provide platforms for their work across the arts sector in Scotland and other parts of the UK.
- 3.2 The Scottish Executive have published three documents in relation to culture, the arts and social inclusion which are relevant to this study.<sup>6, 7, 8</sup> Scotland's Cultural

---

<sup>6</sup> Scottish Executive (2000) *A National Cultural Strategy*: Report on the consultation. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

<sup>7</sup> Scottish Executive (2000) *The Role of Arts in Regeneration*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

<sup>8</sup> Scottish Executive (2000) *Creating our Future, Minding our Past* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive



Strategy, *Creating our Future, Minding our Past* (2000), makes explicit the relevance of culture to the wider social inclusion agenda:

*“The contribution culture can make to wider Scottish Executive priorities such as social justice, economic development, regeneration and equality are realised.”*

The Strategy’s action points include:

*‘Measuring and reporting progress on reducing cultural exclusion because of disability, location, age, ethnicity, economic or educational factors’* and

*‘Establishing an action group to investigate how the languages and cultural traditions of Scotland’s ethnic minorities can be supported.’*

- 3.3 The Scottish Arts Council’s own *Diversity 2002* scheme (linked with other UK Arts Councils) has an expressed commitment to raise the status of the arts by, for and with Scotland’s minority ethnic communities, and to pass on new skills and expertise. Similarly, the Scottish Arts Council’s *Strategic Development Fund* has a strand specifically targeted at Cultural Diversity, the main purpose of which is to raise the profile of the work of minority ethnic artists and arts organisations in Scotland and to enhance arts practice and understanding through partnership. The Scottish Arts Council’s Capital Strategy also identifies facilities for minority ethnic communities as a funding priority.
- 3.4 The first major initiative taken by the Arts Council of England (ACE) was the publication of the Cultural Diversity Green Paper, *The Landscape of Fact* (1997).<sup>9</sup> This focused on the principles of inclusion and equal access and emphasised recommendations on the subjects of employment and training. Interestingly, it recognised growing international links, which broke down barriers and created communities based on ‘interest and vision’ rather than on ‘geography and ethnicity’.
- 3.5 In the summary of responses to the *Landscape of Fact*,<sup>10</sup> three main thrusts – access, development and diversity – were identified by practitioners and professionals from culturally diverse backgrounds. Both the *Landscape of Fact* and the responses it engendered provide a useful context for considering specific ways forward.
- 3.6 The *Cultural Diversity Action Plan* (ACE),<sup>11</sup> driven by the Cultural Diversity Unit of ACE, produced an inclusive definition of diversity:

---

<sup>9</sup> Arts Council of England (1997) *The Landscape of Fact*, London: ACE

<sup>10</sup> Arts Council of England (1997) *A Digest of Responses to the Cultural Diversity Green Paper, ‘The Landscape of Fact’*, London: ACE

<sup>11</sup> Arts Council of England (1998) *Cultural Diversity Action Plan* London: ACE

*'Of aesthetics, aspiration, status and orientation – a diversity in which tradition and innovation sit happily side by side, and on occasion, nourish each other.'* (p.11)

This ACE document acknowledged its debt to a definition used by UNESCO which promotes a very wide principle of diversity and cultural freedom –

*'Cultural freedom, by protecting alternative ways of living, encourages experimentation, diversity, imagination and creativity. Cultural freedom leaves us free to meet one of the most basic needs, the need to define our own basic needs.'*

- 3.7 As ACE enters its next phase, some of the wider challenges which it will face are reflected in the document *Framework for Change*<sup>12</sup>:

*'the debate over 'cultural diversity' has become trapped in hostile visions of racial separation, unfairly favoured minorities and a terminally divided society. It has also been affected by wider fears of loss of cultural identity with the establishment of national assemblies in Scotland and Wales, wavering moves towards Europe, and economic and cultural globalisation.'*

- 3.8 *Framework for Change* reflects the growing awareness of the importance of development agencies – grassroots agencies that have credibility with regard to their own sector and have the confidence to speak to policy makers. These agencies are perceived to have the potential to provide effective communication in both directions.

- 3.9 The document also promotes a model which relates action taken to promote mainstreaming of the arts (opportunity) with that taken to enhance skills at a local base (capacity). It is argued that if issues related to creating opportunities within the mainstream alone are addressed, opportunities will not and cannot be taken up by minority ethnic organisations and individuals; likewise, if grassroots capacity alone is addressed and built up, organisations and individuals will not be able to progress, resulting in ghettoisation. Accordingly, the ACE Framework proposes that:

*'the balance of opportunity and capacity should lie at the heart of Arts Council policy since it marries creative development with equality of provision.'*

- 3.10 Other useful contextual information related to the present study can be found in a recent study<sup>13</sup> which focused mainly on attendance at arts events and cultural locations. Several barriers to attendance were identified and recommendations formulated as a means of addressing these issues.

---

<sup>12</sup> Arts Council of England (2001) *Framework for Change* London: ACE

<sup>13</sup> Jermyn, H. and Desai, P (2000) *Arts - what's in a word? Ethnic minorities and the arts* London: The Arts Council of England

- 3.11 Related to this, a study undertaken by an Edinburgh-based marketing organisation, The Audience Business, examined the issue of under-representation in minority ethnic communities within audiences for the arts. This investigation<sup>14</sup> concluded that the process of increasing the diversity of audiences required a long-term commitment by organisations to widen the definitions of art through consultation and participation of minority ethnic communities.

#### **4. THE MINORITY ETHNIC POPULATION IN SCOTLAND**

- 4.1 The ability to attend and participate in the arts is related to a number of factors in both the majority and minority ethnic population, including cultural tastes which are likely to be related to ethnic origin, age, gender, country of birth, economic factors and proximity to venues.<sup>15</sup> Accordingly, national level, up-to-date statistical information on minority ethnic communities is important for the planning and provision of appropriate services, including those related to the arts, for a multi-ethnic, multi-faith and multi-religious population.
- 4.2 In Scotland, such information is currently not available, although this will be addressed to some extent through the availability of the 2001 Census data. Other information is likely to be forthcoming from a new national survey of the minority ethnic population that is planned by the Scottish Executive.<sup>16</sup> It would be useful to revisit the present study in the light of information resulting from these surveys.
- 4.3 In the absence of current data, as described above, the only statistical information which is available remains the 1991 Census, in which the question of ethnicity was included for the first time. Many commentators are of the view that the minority ethnic population has been under-estimated in the Census data due to lack of information about the survey in languages other than English and lack of trust regarding the purpose for which the data was being collected.<sup>17</sup> However, it remains the only source of statistical information that is currently available at a national level. The other source of statistical information of Scotland's minority ethnic population is a survey carried out by the Scottish Office in 1991, which was limited to the four main cities and the three largest minority ethnic groups.<sup>18</sup>
- 4.4 According to the 1991 Census, the minority ethnic population in Scotland is 62,634 (1.25 per cent of the total Scottish population). The three largest groups are

---

<sup>14</sup> The Audience Business (2001) *Ethnic Minorities and the Arts* (2001) Edinburgh: Audience Business

<sup>15</sup> Jermyn, H. and Desai, P Ibid

<sup>16</sup> System Three (2001) Scoping Survey for a national survey of Scotland's minority ethnic populations. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

<sup>17</sup> Munday, C and Oswald, C (2001) Black and Minority Ethnic Health Inequalities Framework Document. Edinburgh: Lothian Health

<sup>18</sup> Scottish Office (1991) *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland* Central Research Unit, Edinburgh: Scottish Office

the Pakistani population (34% of the minority ethnic population), the Chinese (17%) and the Indian population (16%).<sup>19</sup> Black African, Black Caribbean and Black Other populations (terms used by the Census) account for 10% of the minority ethnic population, and other smaller groups include Fijians and Mauritians and those of mixed race parentage.<sup>20</sup> It is important to note that considerable diversity exists between each of these groups in terms of country of origin, languages spoken and religious and cultural beliefs.

- 4.5 A recent study reports the presence of asylum-seekers and refugees from several countries, including Afghanistan, Kosovo, Sudan, Somalia, Eritrea, Iran, Iraq, Russia, Georgia, Estonia and Chile.<sup>21</sup> Gypsies/Travellers are also recognised by the Commission for Racial Equality as a minority ethnic group.
- 4.6 Analysis of spatial distribution reveals that the minority ethnic population is largely urban and concentrated in Scotland's four main cities, with 1 in 3 living in Glasgow. However, the population is also widely dispersed: the lowest percentages are found in the Borders, Shetlands, Western Isles and Orkney<sup>22</sup>, and the Chinese population is represented in every Scottish local authority area.<sup>23</sup>
- 4.7 Analysis of Census data also reveals that 46% of the minority ethnic population was born in the UK, with the percentage of those born in this country differing across each ethnic group: Black Caribbean (55.6%) Black African (22.8%) Black Other (69.82), Indian (46.2%), Pakistani (53.3%) and Chinese (46.2%).<sup>24</sup>
- 4.8 The minority ethnic population is younger than the majority population (80% of the former are under the age of 40 compared to 54.8% of the latter).<sup>25</sup>
- 4.9 Analysis of the economic position of the minority ethnic population reveals some crude indicators of apparent achievement: for example, the proportions of Indian, Black and Chinese communities in Social Class 1 (Professional) is significantly greater than the white majority.<sup>26</sup> However, analysis of employment status and patterns reveals a very different picture: a significant proportion of the minority

---

<sup>19</sup> Bailey, N, Bowes, A and Sim, D, (1997) The demography of minority ethnic groups in Scotland. In Bowes and Sim Perspectives on Welfare. Aldershot: Ashgate

<sup>20</sup> Dalton, M and Hampton, K. *Scotland's ethnic minority community 1991 A Census Summary. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Fact Sheet No 1* Glasgow: Glasgow Caledonian University

<sup>21</sup> Macaskill, S. and Petrie, M (2000) 'I didn't come here for fun...' Edinburgh: Scottish Refugee Council and Save the Children

<sup>22</sup> Dalton, M and Hampton, K. Ibid

<sup>23</sup> Bailey, N, Bowes, A and Sim, D. Ibid

<sup>24</sup> Bailey, N, Bowes, A and Sim, D. Ibid

<sup>25</sup> Bailey, N, Bowes, A and Sim, D. Ibid

<sup>26</sup> Dalton, M and Hampton, K. Ibid

ethnic population are self-employed, and employment is limited within a narrow range of occupations, including distribution, catering, hotels and repairs industries.<sup>27</sup> Given the lack of research that currently exists on employment opportunities and constraints, it is not known the extent to which such patterns are the result of positive choice or lack of choice, or are due to factors such as racial discrimination.<sup>28</sup> However, a study conducted by the Commission for Racial Equality in Scotland revealed significant gaps between equal opportunities policies and practice in the private sector.<sup>29</sup>

## 5. SCOPE AND AIMS OF THE RESEARCH

5.1 A recent audit of research relating to minority ethnic communities across several key policy areas<sup>30</sup> and the current study revealed a dearth of research relating to culture, identity and the arts. This is the first major study on issues related to access and participation in the arts by Scotland's minority ethnic communities. It is essentially a qualitative study which explores many issues which are central to the development of a culturally diverse policy; it does not claim to provide a comprehensive overview of all aspects of relevance to the development of minority ethnic arts in Scotland.

5.2 The current study is mainly concerned with the Pakistani, Chinese, Indian and African communities in Scotland, which have been identified by the 1991 Census as the four largest minority ethnic groups. We acknowledge that while other groups, largely of minority ethnic origin, including asylum-seekers and refugees, Gypsies/Travellers, and religious and faith communities are present in Scotland and they may share similar experiences in relation to access and participation in the arts, considerable diversity exists between them, which is beyond the scope of this research. It also has to be recognised that there is considerable variation within the groups studied including country of origin, language and religious beliefs. This is particularly true of the African communities. Accordingly, generalised observations must be treated with some amount of caution and an awareness of important differences which may be present.

5.3 The research aims to:

- Examine access to the arts for audiences, participants and artists from culturally diverse backgrounds
- Assess the current support for and infrastructure of culturally diverse arts activity in Scotland

---

<sup>27</sup> Dalton, M and Hampton, K. Ibid

<sup>28</sup> Netto, G, Arshad, R, de Lima, P, Diniz F A, MacEwen, M, Patel, V and Syed, R (2001) *Audit of research on minority ethnic issues in Scotland from a 'Race' Perspective* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

<sup>29</sup> Commission for Racial Equality (2000) *Equal Opportunities and Private Sector Employment in Scotland*. Edinburgh: CRE

<sup>30</sup> Netto, G, Arshad, R, de Lima, P, Diniz F A, MacEwen, M, Patel, V and Syed, R (2001) Ibid

- Inform the planning and development of a policy on the support of work by, with and for people from minority ethnic communities in Scotland

## **6. METHODOLOGY**

6.1 The methodology employed consisted of:

- Focus group discussions with individuals from Scotland's four main minority ethnic groups
- Interviews with representatives from minority ethnic organisations
- Interviews with selected local authorities and mainstream arts agencies
- Interviews with artists from a minority ethnic background
- Focus group discussions with Scottish Arts Council staff and committees

All interviews and focus groups discussions were recorded on audio tape. A short postal survey of local authority arts departments was also conducted. An intensive period of fieldwork took place between September - November 2001.

### **6.2 Focus group discussions**

The main purpose of the focus groups was to explore attitudes to the arts, and views regarding access and participation in the arts. 8 focus groups were conducted, consisting of the following participants. The number of participants in each group is provided in brackets:

African males (6)  
 African females (10)  
 Indian males (8)  
 Indian females (7)  
 Pakistani males (5)  
 Pakistani females (8)  
 Older Chinese people, mixed sex (6)  
 Younger Chinese people, mixed sex (6)

Participants in most of these groups were identified through a combination of close links established with community workers, informal contacts and 'a snow-balling' approach with identified participants referring the researchers on to other potential participants. The need to tap into existing networks largely determined the nature of the groups, resulting in single sex groups from the Pakistani, Indian and African community, and groups of older and younger people from the Chinese community. All of the focus groups were conducted on weekends or at night during the week. Discussions lasted 1.5 hours. All discussions were conducted in English, with the exception of the group of Chinese elders which was facilitated by two interpreters as well as one of the researchers. In the group of Chinese youth, participants helped to translate on behalf of one youth who was able to understand English but not speak it fluently. Each participant received a gift voucher of £15 pounds in recognition of the effort involved.

The focus groups were all conducted in Edinburgh, where established links with a number of voluntary organisations facilitated access to participants. The main strength of conducting the focus group discussions in one location was that it ensured that views of the participants on access and participation in the arts related to the same local area; this allowed some generalisations to be made across all ethnic groups, and for some comparisons to be drawn. A limitation of conducting all the discussions in one location was that issues related to access and participation in the arts across different parts of Scotland could not be fully considered through this strand of the methodology.

In particular, it has to be borne in mind that the discussions took place in an urban context and in a city renowned for its international arts festivals. The views of those living outside the major towns and cities and in a rural context in relation to access to the arts are likely to be considerably different. Interviews conducted with mainstream arts organizations and local authorities (described in detail below) sought to include a rural perspective.

It should also be borne in mind that there is considerable individual variation among the participants in each of the above groups, some of which is related to age, gender, social class, level of education, employment status and nature of employment.

### 6.3 **Interviews with Minority Ethnic Agencies and Artists**

Considerable effort was invested in identifying agencies which reflected the interests of various ethnic groups, participation across art-forms and geographical spread. 12 agencies were identified for individual interviews:

- African Women's Group (Aberdeen)
- Central Scotland Arab Community (Stirling)
- Edinburgh Chinese Youth Culture and Dance Group (Edinburgh)
- Fife Chinese Cultural Association (St. Andrews)
- Sangeet Mala (Glenrothes)
- Glasgow African Arts (Glasgow)
- Glasgow Oriental Dance Group (Glasgow)
- Indian Dance Collective (Edinburgh)
- Men in Mind (Edinburgh)
- Mela (Edinburgh)
- Scottish Ethnic and Cultural Organisation (Edinburgh)
- Scottish Academy of Asian Arts (Glasgow)

Establishing contact and arranging interview times which were suitable was also time-consuming due to these groups' heavy reliance on volunteers who were employed in other areas of work. Interviews generally lasted about one hour and fifteen minutes.

Six artists, working in different art-forms, were identified from a range of minority ethnic groups. This included those who were involved in dance, writing, painting, photography and calligraphy. Interviews lasted an average of 1.5 hours each.

#### **6.4 Interviews with local authorities and mainstream arts agencies**

Careful consideration was given to selecting local authorities and mainstream arts agencies. Three local authorities were identified and interviewed:

Highland Council  
Glasgow City Council  
Edinburgh City Council

The process of selection was in part based on responses received from a short postal questionnaire to all thirty two local authorities, which elicited information relating to funding directed to minority ethnic artistic activity in the last three years. This allowed us to identify one local authority in an area where the population of minority ethnic population is small and scattered, and where some funds have been directed towards culturally diverse arts provision over the last three years (Highland Council). The other two local authorities selected were from areas where the minority ethnic population in Scotland is concentrated, and which had the largest funding programmes related to this area (Glasgow and Edinburgh City Councils).

In selecting mainstream arts organisations, particular attention was paid to geographical spread (which ranged from the Highlands and Islands to the four cities of Aberdeen, Dundee, Edinburgh and Glasgow), as well as to range and scale of each organisation. Some organisations specialise in single and clearly Western art forms such as the Scottish Chamber Orchestra, while others host a greater range of art-forms such as the Lemon Tree. Performing and visual arts were both represented. Care was taken to include organisations with differing remits such as those that work within a clearly international context (the Fruitmarket Gallery), to others that work at a local, regional and national level, (the Lemon Tree). The organisations included in the study were:

Dundee Repetory Theatre  
Fruitmarket Gallery  
HI-Arts  
Scottish Chamber Orchestra  
The Lemon Tree

Interviews conducted with the local authorities and mainstream arts organisations listed above lasted an average of 1.5 hours.

#### **6.5 Focus group discussions with Scottish Arts Council staff**

Two focus group discussions were also conducted with 10 Scottish Arts Council staff and 5 Committee members representing all Scottish Arts Council art-forms. The first focus group meeting was attended by the Chairs of Craft and Combined Arts, the Head of Communications, the Audience Development Manager, a representative from the Capital Committee, Literature and Crafts Officers and the Black and Minority Ethnic Arts officer. The second focus group meeting was attended by the Heads of Music, Dance, Drama, Visual Arts and Capital, the Dance Chair and a representative from the Music Committee. Discussions lasted for two hours.



All interview frameworks and topic guides for focus group discussions are presented in the Appendices.

## **7. STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT**

- 7.1 Following this introductory chapter, the findings of the research are presented in five chapters: the perspectives of minority ethnic groups; the perspectives of minority ethnic organisations, the perspectives of artists of minority ethnic origin; the perspectives of local authorities and mainstream arts organisations, and the perspectives of the Scottish Arts Council. The final chapter consists of conclusions and recommendations for the arts sector which are directed towards the mainstreaming of arts, with, by and for minority ethnic communities in Scotland. All quotes, illustrating points arising from the interviews and focus group discussions are reported in italics. The extent to which quotes are attributed has been influenced by the need to protect the confidentiality of all participants to ensure an open discussion of the issues involved. Accordingly, in the first chapter, given the large numbers participants involved, we are able to attribute quotes by the ethnic group and gender of the individuals responsible; in the remaining chapters, quotes are not attributed.

## **8. TERMINOLOGY**

- 8.1 The term 'minority ethnic' is used throughout this report to refer to the four main ethnic groups that are the main concern of this study, and to reflect the diversity of Scotland's minority ethnic communities. This reflects an avoidance of the term 'black' which has been seen to be unhelpful in drawing attention to one particular minority ethnic group.<sup>31</sup> We acknowledge that the choice of this particular terminology takes place within the context of a debate on identity and language that is ongoing and shifting.
- 8.2 The term 'mainstream' is used in this report to refer to agencies and organisations that are not primarily concerned with catering to the needs of minority ethnic groups. We acknowledge that this term too, is subject to attendant, ongoing shifts of meaning and interpretation. Unless specified specifically, 'art' is used to refer to all forms of art (mainstream as well as that which is associated with a particular minority ethnic group).

---

<sup>31</sup> Scottish Executive (2001) *Making it real: A race equality strategy for Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

## CHAPTER 2: PERSPECTIVES OF MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS

### 1 ATTITUDES TOWARDS THE ARTS

- 1.1 This chapter reports on 8 focus group discussions conducted in Edinburgh, 2 from each of the four main communities in Scotland (Pakistani, Indian, Chinese and African). Generally, there is considerable interest in a diverse range of arts, which included those which were mainstream as well as those which were associated with minority ethnic communities. Benefits from attending and participating in the arts included the chance to relax, to be refreshed, to be stimulated, empowered and enriched.
- 1.2 Benefits from attending and participating in arts associated with minority ethnic cultures included the opportunity to connect with one's roots, to learn about one's culture, to pass on cultural knowledge from one generation to the next and to meet others from a similar minority ethnic background.
- 1.3 In particular, participants spoke about the vital role that the arts played in cultivating a sense of pride in their ethnic identity and in maintaining links with culture and traditions:

*'If you don't know where you are coming from, you don't know where you are going to'* (African, male)

One of the main motivating factors reported by parents in providing their children with opportunities for exposure to minority ethnic arts was to raise self-esteem and to enable them to 'operate from a position of cultural strength' in a society which was often perceived to be racist:

*'so that they...want to belong to Africa and not feel ashamed of being African, and be proud of themselves and break out of their shells'* (African, female)

*'I think it is very important for them to get that exposure, to get their own identity, because they are living in a multi-racial society, they are living in a racist society'* (Indian, female)

- 1.4 Generally, the kinds of artistic activity (mainstream and minority ethnic) that participants were interested in was related to a number of factors, including age, country of birth, number of years spent in Britain, and the opportunity for exposure to various forms of art.
- 1.5 The older participants, most of whom were first generation migrants, had a strong interest in preserving traditional and classical art which were closely related to their culture, religious and ethnic identity, and language.
- 1.6 Younger participants, some of whom had been born in this country, also expressed an interest in activity associated with a minority ethnic culture. However, they were also very interested in learning about and participating in

mainstream arts. Some saw this interest in both forms of art as an expression of their dual identity:

*'Young people get caught between Indian and British cultures – it is a question of getting access to both'* (Indian, male)

*'I can't go to Malawi and be, claim to be Malawi, because as soon as I walk in, they know I haven't lived in that country, they know that there is something different about the way that I speak, that I walk, that I dress, but here, I don't fit in completely either.'* (African, female)

Interestingly, the Chinese group of young participants reported that even among young people, those who had migrated here had a greater knowledge of, and interest in, Chinese arts than those who had been born here, due to greater exposure to the arts and culture of their country of origin.

- 1.7 Among both the older and younger generation, exposure to the arts in general was seen to be a key factor in generating interest:

*'It has to be in your system, as in your culture, or in your education'* (Pakistani, male)

*'...In your environment, in your family, or in your schooling, it's got to start somewhere early. If it's drilled into you early enough, then you will enjoy those things'* (Pakistani male)

A few parents reported that their own lack of exposure to the arts limited the extent to which they could provide their children with such opportunities:

*'We've never been brought up like that. I don't know where to start or where to take them, to tell you the truth'* (Pakistani, female)

Accordingly, schools were seen to play an important role in providing young people with opportunities to experience and participate in a wide range of arts.

- 1.8 Many parents across the groups expressed a keen interest in providing their children with opportunities for exposure to minority ethnic arts:

*'We have to introduce our children to traditional arts ... I feel very, very strongly about it – that we have to introduce them – because there is enough exposure to other arts'* (Indian, female)

Some parents felt that they had an important role to play in cultivating an interest in arts associated with their culture among the children:

*'At the end of the day, it all boils down to family, how strong the family is and whether the family is traditionalist or not'* (Chinese, female)

- 1.9 Among those arts which were seen to be distinctly associated with Chinese culture were Chinese opera, Chinese painting, the Lion Dance, Dragon Boat, acrobatic troupes, Chinese circus, paper-cutting, Chinese chess, calligraphy,

sewing Chinese clothes, Qi gong exercises, Chinese classical music, Chinese knot-making and Chinese poetry.

- 1.10 Those activities which were associated with African culture included story-telling, African dance, drumming, reggae and calypso music, designing African clothes, cooking African food, henna painting, hair-braiding, weaving, plaiting, African poetry, books written by African writers, films directed and produced by Africans, carving and poetry.
- 1.11 Activities associated with Pakistani culture included Quwali (devotional music), mushairas (Urdu poetry reading), folk music, the production of ceramic tiles, Moghul prints and other artefacts, watching Pakistani 'dramas' broadcast on satellite television or Pakistani films (classical and contemporary), stage shows featuring 'Bhangra' music (dance music, often played at stage shows and discotheques) or Punjabi groups, and plays performed in Urdu.
- 1.12 Among the activities associated with Indian culture were classical and folk dance, the playing of Indian musical instruments such as the tabla and the sitar, reading books written by Indian writers in English, the production of Indian artefacts such as carvings of ivory or wood, furniture and soft furnishings, vocal performances and Indian philosophy.
- 1.13 Many minority ethnic artistic activities were associated with traditional or religious festivals, such as Chinese New Year, Eid (Muslim festival) and Deepavali (Hindu festival) or special occasions:

*'We have a song and dance for every special occasion, weddings, funerals, the end of the dry season, the birth of twins'* (African, female)

Some of the arts which were associated with minority ethnic cultures were seen to be closely related to religion. For instance, Indian dance was often a form of worship or used to dramatise religious stories.

- 1.14 Interests in certain arts associated with minority ethnic cultures appeared to be closely related to age. For instance, older Pakistanis were more likely to be interested in Quwali and older Chinese people in Chinese opera, interests which were less likely to be shared by younger people in these groups. Indian and Pakistani young people were more likely to be interested in Bhangra music and music which was a fusion of Western and Eastern elements, interests which were not likely to be shared to the same degree by older people in the same ethnic groups.

## **2 ACCESS TO THE ARTS**

- 2.1 Most participants felt that Edinburgh was 'a cultural city' in which there were many opportunities to enjoy a wide range of mainstream arts:

*'With all the festivals, the museums, scientific displays, this seems to be one city in which anyone can find art'* (Indian, male)

Many participants reported an enjoyment of a wide range of mainstream arts, including ballet, opera, the theatre, classical concerts, contemporary and pop music and film.

2.2 Access to the arts in general was influenced by many factors which might be applicable to the majority population, as well as those which are culturally specific. Among those factors which were generally applicable included:

- The costs of attending events
- Proximity to venues, and associated travel costs
- Timings of events
- Child-care responsibilities among parents of young people

The group of Chinese elders in particular felt that costs were particularly prohibitive and ruled out access to most mainstream arts events. Other participants reported that such events were expensive to attend since they usually attended these events as a family, which meant that costs were multiplied for all those attending:

*'Your mum, your dad and your three kids, almost a hundred pounds there. You might be able to afford it but someone else who ... (comes from a) working class can't'* (Pakistani, male)

2.3 The barriers related to attending the arts which might be applicable to the majority population but which were perceived as greater among those belonging to a minority ethnic community included:

- Lack of relevance and previous exposure to certain art-forms, such as ballet and opera
- Conservative views and discomfort with the use of 'swear' words and scenes of a sexual nature

2.4 Literacy and language barriers also act as barriers to accessing mainstream arts among some older people. For instance, the group of Chinese elders reported that their interest in accessing mainstream art was restricted by their inability to speak English, their lack of knowledge of where museums and galleries were located, and how to get to these locations. A few younger Chinese people also reported lack of fluency in speaking English as a deterrent to attending the arts, including the visual arts, pointing out that the appreciation of a painting was enhanced by knowledge of the artist, its title and background information.

2.5 Additionally, certain cultural and religious attitudes may also restrict access to certain mainstream arts. For instance, some Pakistani participants reported that they had not been allowed to go to the concerts or the theatre when they were younger. However, participants in both the Pakistani groups reported changing attitudes and a personal interest in encouraging their children to experience these arts. Some cultural views in relation to segregation between the sexes remained:

*'if it's an Asian function, the men and women do tend to sit separately and its mainly because of rowed seating and you don't want to have to sit next*

*to an Asian man... You just don't do that – you sit in a different row.'*  
(Pakistani, female)

Consequently, some Pakistani women expressed a preference for single sex seating either in the form of rows or events for women only.

2.6 The main barrier to accessing art associated with minority ethnic cultures in Edinburgh reported in all the focus groups centred around limited provision:

- Pakistani participants reported that the main opportunities for experiencing art which originated from Pakistan were the Glasgow and Edinburgh Mela
- The main focus of artistic activity associated with Chinese culture was reported to be organised around Chinese New Year
- African participants reported that arts events associated with their culture were almost 'non-existent'
- Indian arts events were reported by participants to be 'small-scale and self-generated', although it was noted that several events had been showcased in the Edinburgh Festival Fringe this year.

Arts provision was reported to be mainly dependent on programmes organised by voluntary groups, which were restricted in their ability to cater to a wide range of tastes.

2.7 Fluency in certain minority ethnic languages also restricted access to certain arts which were associated with these languages, particularly among young people. For example, young people of Pakistani origin who were not able to speak Urdu fluently find it difficult to access mushairas in that language. There was some interest in attending classes to learn such languages.

2.8 Many participants, particularly first generation migrants, reported a deep sense of loss at the lack of opportunities for experiencing arts associated with their culture:

*'There is such an abundance of art and history which cannot be found here.'* (Chinese, female)

Some participants felt that maintaining contact with their culture through the arts was essential for psychological well-being as a minority in a predominantly white society:

*'Culture is something I need to hold on to, to survive here, that is why it is scary when you don't see it'* (African, male)

2.9 Younger participants reported that while access to mainstream arts was relatively easy, it was often very difficult to get information or access to art which was associated with minority ethnic culture:

*'When I want to go for something related to Chinese culture, I find it very difficult to do. I would love to listen to pan flute music but it is so difficult to find'* (Chinese, male)

Other particular difficulties reported were obtaining books written by African and Indian writers or viewing films produced or directed by Africans.

- 2.10 Participants also expressed a wish to view minority ethnic arts events in mainstream venues, which they felt would raise the profile of such events and encourage people to attend such events:

*'Some of the most popular culture and art things that are from Pakistan for instance...if they were brought in. ..to a place like the Festival Theatre maybe that would really encourage Asian people to go and see the theatre. Whereas, what happens with us, we seem to see these shows in Portobello Town Hall or in a wee campus somewhere'* (Pakistani, male)

- 2.11 The availability of satellite and cable television had increased access to some forms of art which were associated with minority ethnic groups, such as Pakistani drama or Chinese classical music. However, participants reported that such experiences were significantly different from the opportunity of experiencing 'live' performances.

### **3 PARTICIPATION IN THE ARTS**

- 3.1 Considerable interest was expressed in relation to participating in the arts but participants reported that there were relatively few opportunities for doing so, particularly in arts associated with minority ethnic communities. Among the many benefits of performing in such activity reported were opportunities for self expression, making contact with cultural roots, socialising with others from a similar background and increasing self esteem:

*You feel more comfortable with your own identity, you become more confident of your own identity, you feel proud of the way that you dress, you are proud of the way you look and you feel proud that you are part of the larger community as a result.'* (Indian, female)

It was also seen as a means of generating a sense of belonging:

*'Getting together dancing or singing is about community spirit'*  
(African, female)

Maintaining mental health was also reported as a motivating factor among those who had been actively involved in participating in the arts:

*'To me, it is not just a hobby, it guarantees you balance in the future'*  
(African, male)

The sheer enjoyment of actively participating in an event was also reported:

*'It makes us feel young and happy'* (Chinese, female)

*'It's a lot of fun to be involved in the production of something'*  
(Pakistani, female)

3.2 Active participation in the arts was mostly carried out through minority ethnic voluntary groups, with limited or no funding. Without exception, all the groups were of the view that access to funding was instrumental to enabling minority ethnic people to participate in arts which were associated with their communities.

3.3 Both African groups expressed the view that they were 'a minority within a minority.' They felt that their small size, the considerable diversity in the African community, the dispersed nature of the population across Scotland, the lack of voluntary organisations which promoted African art and lack of recognition of its value were particular barriers to accessing funding.

3.4 There was a perception that there were limited opportunities for young people to learn arts which were associated with minority ethnic communities and to learn the skills associated with particular art-forms in Scotland. This was seen as a barrier to promoting participation in the arts, which could only be overcome through the allocation of adequate resources:

*'You can't really learn something until and unless you give it a period of time so...unless there is provision of proper channelled resources at all levels to allow for that educational process and capacity building to take place, it becomes a very frustrating exercise of raising hopes, exposing our children and those who live here to various art forms with no outcome on a long term basis.'* (Indian, female)

3.5 Other barriers to participation in arts which were associated with minority ethnic communities were the lack of opportunities for professional training for minority ethnic artists in Scotland, which was seen as a major barrier to their development. This included the lack of artists who could act as role models and mentors to aspiring artists.

*'Without proper training, they remain as amateur artists only.'* (Chinese female)

As a result of this, it was reported that some artists had moved to England.

3.6 Related to the ability to participate more actively in the arts, all the groups involved were unanimous in their view about the desirability of minority ethnic people being represented on decision-making bodies. However, the groups were also quick to point out the importance of involving the 'right kind of person' who was appropriately qualified in the arts and was familiar with the interests of his or her community:

*'not just somebody who's always up for volunteering for things...'*  
(Pakistani, female)  
*'and hasn't got the background'* (Pakistani, female)



*'they should have the background so that they know about things which others would not know about (Chinese, female)*

It was felt that the inclusion of appropriately qualified minority ethnic people would better inform decision-making through their contribution of knowledge of the arts associated with their particular culture. It was also felt that such people might be more familiar with, and sympathetic to, the difficulties, interests and aspirations of their respective communities, in relation to accessing and participating in the arts. Representation of minority ethnic people on decision-making bodies was also seen to be useful in facilitating the application of equal opportunities policies.

#### **4 DISSEMINATION OF INFORMATION ABOUT ARTS EVENTS**

- 4.1 Generally participants of all the groups were of the view that the publicising of arts events was mainly by word of mouth, and variable in its effectiveness.
- 4.2 The use of a number of mechanisms was suggested to more effectively disseminate information about arts events, including the use of mailing lists and advertising in the media. Information could also be sent to places where minority ethnic people congregate, such as places of worship.
- 4.3 It was also suggested that the Scottish Arts Council could play a role in centrally coordinating information about arts activities associated with minority ethnic cultures across Scotland. This was seen to be particularly important given the dispersed nature of the minority ethnic population.

## **KEY FINDINGS**

1. Considerable diversity exists between and within minority ethnic communities in their artistic interests.
2. Generational differences in artistic interests and aspirations are apparent within each minority ethnic community.
3. Opportunities to access art associated with minority ethnic cultures are limited mainly due to scarce provision.
4. Currently most arts provision which is associated with minority ethnic cultures is undertaken by volunteers.
5. Participants felt that it was important for minority ethnic people to be represented on decision-making bodies to ensure equal access to funding.
6. Dissemination of information about arts events was seen to be variable in its effectiveness.

## CHAPTER 3: PERSPECTIVES OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS

### 1 BACKGROUND AND ACTIVITIES OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS

- 1.1 The twelve organisations included in the study and listed in the introduction were associated with each of Scotland's four main minority ethnic communities. They were located in Aberdeen, Stirling, Edinburgh, St. Andrews, Glenrothes and Glasgow.
- 1.2 These organisations differed from each other in a number of respects related to whether arts were central or peripheral to the activities of the organisation; the developmental stage of the organisation; experience of success in relation to funding; the size of membership and the purpose of arts within the organisation.
- 1.3 The minority ethnic organisations interviewed can be divided into three types: 'cultural' (those concerned with maintaining a cultural inheritance); 'arts-led' (those concerned primarily with art for its own sake); 'art therapy' (those concerned with using the arts for healing purposes).
- 1.4 'Cultural' organisations see themselves as maintaining the culture of a particular community. Arts activities are seen as part of this role, although the distinction between arts and cultural events is often unclear. Examples of such organisations include the Central Scotland Arab Community, African Women's Group (Aberdeen) and Fife Chinese Cultural Association. The main roles of such organisations include:
  - Passing on language and culture to second and third generation children
  - Providing social contacts for isolated members of the community;
  - Providing the Scottish public with the opportunity to learn about other cultures.

These organisations aim to dispel undermining and stereotypical attitudes towards their particular minority group by demonstrating the richness of their cultural heritage.

*'There are people who think Arabs all come from one country – perhaps Saudi Arabia...Once I met somebody and he thought Saddam Hussein is the president of all the Arabs. The media is telling them only one side of the story. I don't blame them because they don't know.'*

*'Main purpose is to show Chinese culture. Because we think that at the moment people do not know about Chinese culture, they just know about Chinese food, take-aways, restaurants and the martial arts. So we really want to change the image of the Chinese people'*

*'There are people who feel we have been marginalised. The news about Africa is always negative... It's like, we can't deal with this, this is the way they want to see us and there is nothing we can do. ...Then there are people like me that say we can do something.'*

- 1.5 'Arts-led' organisations focus on the promotion, performance and production of arts. Cultural and educational roles within the minority ethnic community may be considered of great importance but are clearly secondary in terms of the main objectives. Examples of such organisations are Sangeet Mala, Glasgow African Arts and the Edinburgh Mela.
- 1.6 'Art therapy' organisations are those which use art to further the health and well being of their members, goals which they pursue by other means such as providing information, providing alternative therapies and encouraging exercise. Only one organisation was interviewed of this type, that is, Men in Mind.
- 1.7 Arts activities engaged in by the twelve minority ethnic organisations interviewed are diverse, including classical music, dance and vocal performances, photography, drama, drumming, story-telling, writing, weaving and tie-and-dye workshops. A number of these organisations organised 'open days', cultural events for celebrations such as Chinese New Year, or annual festivals such as the Edinburgh and Glasgow Mela.
- 1.8 The range of activities offered by each organisation was influenced by a number of factors including the interests of its members, the availability of teachers, budgetary constraints and the facilities which were available. A number of organisations spoke of difficulties in recruiting and retaining appropriate teachers in Scotland, and about the greater opportunities for teachers in England. Trained professionals and committed and experienced enthusiasts were influential in determining the type of artistic activities which were carried out by an organisation. For instance, the availability of a professional tabla player has led one organisation to provide classes from beginner to advanced level in the tabla. Similarly, the availability of teachers who have been trained in the Bharathayam and Kathak traditions of Indian dance has led the same organisation to provide classes in these dance-forms.
- 1.9 A major gap identified by most of the agencies was the lack of an appropriate venue for organising classes and rehearsals. Many arts activities were regularly held in community centres and schools, with limited facilities. This restricted the range of activities which could be undertaken, the days and times at which classes could be organised and the range of participants who could take part.

*'Our major problem is just the lack of area in here you know for practising. And the only time we get free is on Saturdays, for about an hour between 12 and 1 when we use the hall here, but if we needed to practice somewhere else we need to hire a hall ... But you know that's at a cost'*

*'At the moment the workshops take place on a Friday evening at the community centre...it may not be a suitable time for everyone. We don't have another slot to offer people if that time slot is not suitable.'*

*'We looked at the possibility of buying a building in Edinburgh where you could have your offices and facilities and also have an area for people to do a bit of performing and participate in maybe an arts exhibition throughout the year, rather than just at the MELA weekend. And then*

*obviously that would then be an opportunity to do that, which there isn't really... You need obviously a hub of activity where people know they can go to'*

- 1.10 Other constraints related to the availability and affordability of non-Western classical musical instruments and costumes for public performances.
- 1.11 Decision-making on the content of projects, programmes and workshops is typically achieved by group consultation. Most of the organisations are small enough for collaborative discussions to take place between members and management committees. Teachers or tutors often take the lead in initiating new projects:

*'Our director... is [a] very good singer, she has got very good knowledge of music, and then she discusses with people, and then we decide all together what to do.'*

- 1.12 Only one organisation interviewed spoke of clearly defined strategies for future developments although a number mentioned ideas for new projects. A number of organisations aspired to widen their range of artistic events to cater to the diverse interests of their members but were limited by practical constraints:

*'I'm hoping to upgrade the Chinese Dancing Group; there's more interest in that side. You know the children are willing to learn. And it's just the lack of facilities that we have, and you know the area for teaching. And especially trying to get a professional teacher in – which is another cost as well. And we try to bring back some old dancing to sort of mix in with the new ones just to make it better for the shows.'*

## **2 FUNDING**

- 2.1 Four organisations currently receive local authority funding, and others had been provided with a venue by the local authority for weekly classes. A further three organisations had received local authority funding in the past. Four organisations interviewed had received Scottish Arts Council funding at some point. Not surprisingly, morale is much higher in organisations which are currently funded, by either the Scottish Arts Council or a local authority.
- 2.2 The range of organisations consulted were at various stages of development. Some organisations had only recently been set up, while others had been established for a number of years. Developmental stages were also linked to organisational success in securing funding. Organisations which had succeeded in obtaining funding had generally more opportunities to develop the interests of their members in artistic activities, and to organise public events. For example, as a result of obtaining funding, one organisation which had begun with an interest in cultural activities had evolved into an arts-led organisation.
- 2.3 Funding aspirations differ, with 'cultural' and 'art therapy' organisations mainly seeking project funding, while most of the 'arts-led' organisations consulted

sought core funding. Arts activities in cultural organisations tended to be heavily reliant on securing project funding:

*'Obviously once the money is available, the brain would be very creative and you come up with things. But, as we say, you have to extend your legs according to your blanket.'*

2.4 'Arts led' organisations expressed the view that they were operating under extremely difficult funding constraints. Securing core funding for staff was reported to be particularly difficult. One of the minority ethnic organisations interviewed had been running for over 25 years and had only received funding for administrative support in the last few years. Amongst all the organisations interviewed, only one person was employed on a full-time salary from arts based grants. Another person was employed part-time, and a third organisation was in the process of recruiting for staff.

2.5 The main reason given for difficulty in applying for funding was lack of time and resources because most organisations interviewed are run by volunteers:

*'Time. Everyone's busy. It's not easy to attend committee meetings and to fill in forms.'*

*'The main thing with fund-raising is always the manpower to actually do the work for these funding applications.'*

2.6 Organisations experienced difficulty in applying for grants for a number of other reasons:

- Lack of knowledge of available grants and funding bodies (for example, many had not heard of the Scottish Arts Council)
- Lack of experience of providing the detailed financial information expected from funding bodies (for example, annual reports or accounts)
- Uncertainty about how much and what type of information to provide
- Difficulty in writing in English
- Lack of familiarity with the appropriate terminology
- Lack of familiarity with local authority procedures
- Difficulties in meeting criteria (for example, in drawing a distinction between 'education' and 'culture')
- Difficulties in illustrating the relevance of proposals to the social and political context
- High turnover of volunteers, which often meant that experience gained in this area could not be drawn upon.

2.7 A number of factors discouraged organisations from applying for grants. Several respondents reported having to fill in lengthy grant applications for small sums of money. One organisation explained that they were reluctant to apply for grants because they felt they were expected to demonstrate they were a disadvantaged group in order to qualify for funding, thereby confirming an existing negative stereotype.

- 2.8 Overall, there is a lack of confidence and optimism when organisations discuss funding opportunities. They reported a lack of understanding as to why applications had been turned down:

*'There must be a few things they are looking for, but I didn't know. So I probably put the wrong information that they don't want... They want something crucial but I don't know.'*

- 2.9 Some organisations felt frustrated by what they perceived to be the inflexible criteria of grant applications, which they felt revealed a lack of understanding of the needs and interests of their members:

*'The funding body sets the criteria, the way they see it. It achieves their objectives, but it doesn't achieve the objectives of the communities.'*

For instance, grants for some purposes (an example given was language classes) were perceived to be much more difficult to obtain than others (an example given was childcare) but such grants may not coincide with the priorities of the organisation. The organisations felt that they were better informed than funding bodies about the artistic inspirations of their members:

*'They say the person who wears the shoes knows where it pinches.'*

### **3 ARTS ASSOCIATED WITH MINORITY ETHNIC COMMUNITIES**

- 3.1 Most organisations found it difficult to distinguish between 'art' and 'non-art' or replied in general terms:

*'It's very difficult to draw a boundary between art and non-art'*

*'Most people's definition of what is art is perhaps quite narrow and I think it should be wider...I would like us not being so focused but ...trying to do more in the arts world.'*

*'Art is life.'*

- 3.2 The lack of a clear distinction between 'art' and 'non art' may cause significant difficulties when organisations apply to funding bodies who may have a different understanding of what constitutes art. For example, one organisation reported that its application for funds to run language classes had not been successful because this was considered to come under the remit of education. Language classes for children were run by at least three other organisations interviewed, which perceived language to be an important part of cultural heritage and expression, and therefore did not draw a distinction between language learning and other activities which are more widely understood to be artistic.

#### **4. PARTICIPANTS AND AUDIENCES**

- 4.1 The organisations interviewed reported that participants in their activities came from a diverse range of backgrounds. These included males and females, first and second generation, those in paid employment, those caring for the home and children, those who had retired and students. Organisations were interested in attracting a wide range of participants, and several talked about the role of their organisation in overcoming social isolation. Some organisations actively sought to extend the ethnic origin of their participants to include those from the wider community. Others, such as the Edinburgh MELA, sought to attract participants from diverse minority ethnic backgrounds.
- 4.2 Although all the organisations interviewed were based in the cities, a number revealed that participants travelled very long distances from surrounding rural areas to take part in activities. Some organisations were making active efforts to attract participants who lived out with the cities.
- 4.3 While none of the organisations reported difficulties in attracting participants in general, some organisations found that it was difficult to attract certain categories of participants such as young people, males or a particular ethnic group. Some organisations attributed this to factors such as working hours, which might conflict with the restricted times at which the organisations were able to organise their activities. One organisation reported that they were planning 'taster workshops' to enable potential participants to explore whether or not they were interested in attending the regular weekly classes.
- 4.4 Most of the organisations were not able to give examples of professional development for participants who had been involved in the organisation. Some explained that they had been established too recently to provide such opportunities. There was only one notable exception, where advanced level participants could move on to participate in professional forums of music and dance in which their teachers were involved.
- 4.5 Among the resources which organisations felt would enable them to better support participants in engaging in artistic activities was increased provision of musical instruments and costumes, the supply of which was very limited. The former was felt to be particularly useful to beginners. The cost of the latter was reported to be high and possibly prohibitive for young participants who might not be able to use them again.
- 4.6 Several organisations regularly organised public arts-related events. Among the aims underlying the organising of such events were to allow those involved and their families to observe the progress that had been made, to promote the organisation and to attract more participants. Some of the more experienced 'arts-led' organisations expressed the view that they were promoting events of specialist interest and that attracting new audiences was as important, or more important than aiming for commercial success.
- 4.7 Although some organisations had examples of well-planned publicity campaigns which included leafleting and newspaper coverage, there was a general



consensus that 'word of mouth' was the most common means by which events were publicised.

- 4.8 'Arts-led' organisations tended to be the most successful in attracting mainstream audiences. These organisations were also more likely to be linked into other advertising networks. For example, one organisation was assisted by their local authority who produced a press release and posters. In contrast, 'cultural' organisations appeared to lack knowledge and experience in publicising events, although they too aspired to attract wider audiences.
- 4.9 While organisations generally welcomed the opportunity to perform to new audiences at events planned by other organisations, it was reported that such events were not always well-attended or planned with sensitivity. One organisation was extremely discouraged after being asked to perform at two inappropriate venues for small audiences. In this example, the event organisers had entirely misinterpreted the needs and motivation of the performers:

*'The feedback from group was 'we are not a circus' why are we perform[ing] here...It's a big field with a Marquee and the middle is a circle like a dog show or something.'*

## **5. TRAINING IN ARTS - RELATED ACTIVITIES**

- 5.1 Opportunities for training in this area appear to be extremely limited, with no organisations reporting any experience of formal training in relation to the work they undertook. Most organisations appeared to be largely unaware of areas in which they might benefit from training, including arts administration and marketing, and appeared not to have reflected on training needs.

## **6. LINKS AND COLLABORATION WITH OTHER ORGANISATIONS AND ARTISTS**

- 6.1 In general, the organisations interviewed perceived themselves to be isolated from other similar organisations. This was consistent with the lack of information they were able to provide on their activities. However, several organisations spoke of successful collaborative events with well-known Scottish artists, and others reported that they wished to encourage such events. Such events provided organisations with opportunities to perform to wider audiences, and in appropriate venues. Several organisations had provided workshops in schools and one described a very extensive tour of schools across Scotland.
- 6.2 Organisations were divided over the issue of bringing in artists from abroad or from England to perform in Scotland. Some felt this expertise would be a positive influence. Others felt that more opportunities should go to artists living and working in Scotland. Yet others expressed a wish for more opportunities for artists from abroad and from across Britain, and for professionals and non-professionals, to perform together.

- 6.3 Few organisations were able to report ‘models of good practice’, speaking instead of organisations which had provided inspiration, which were often located in their country of origin. Several organisations felt that they were breaking new ground and therefore were not able to learn from existing models.
- 6.4 Related to the perceived lack of models of good practice, one of the roles most frequently suggested for the Scottish Arts Council and local authorities was to coordinate opportunities for networking. Minority ethnic organisations did not lack awareness of the benefits of networking and were keen to learn from each other. One organisation had taken the initiative of planning a seminar on ‘cultural diversity and the arts’. The most common reason given for not taking part in networking opportunities was the lack of such opportunities and the lack of time.
- 6.5 It is noticeable that where organisations had formed networks, this was very much through key individuals. For example, there were links between Sangeet Mala, Indacol, East of Scotland Bengali Association and the Scottish Academy of Asian Arts. These small networks appear ‘self-contained’. In contrast, other organisations did very little in the way of networking. For example, three organisations of the same minority ethnic group, with broadly the same aims, in three different Scottish cities, had no contact with each other and were not even aware of their counterparts in other parts of Scotland.
- 6.6 It was noticeable that in relation to existing links and collaborations, most organisations tended to mention other minority ethnic organisations and often mentioned the local Race Equality Council. In contrast, there was a noticeable lack of links with mainstream arts organisations. One participant commented that mainstream organisations tended to see themselves as ‘open to everyone’ without actually considering barriers to participation by people from minority ethnic groups. One organisation reported a link with a local school in that for one of its members, a student who had learnt to play the tabla was able to use this knowledge and skill as a basis for taking the Music Standard Grade Examination.
- 6.7 Overall, the picture which emerges is one of a number of small, grass-roots organisations which have few opportunities for contact with each other, and limited opportunity to obtain support and advice from others. The majority of organisations were isolated, and were aware that this was the case.

## **7. PERCEPTIONS OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL**

- 7.1 Overall views on the Scottish Arts Council varied, depending on the type of organisation, funding received and how long the organisation has been in operation. Several organisations had not heard of the Scottish Arts Council and were consequently uncertain of the role that it currently played or could potentially play. Two organisations had the impression that it was necessary to have personal contacts with the Scottish Arts Council to secure funding.
- 7.2 Organisations expressed the view that the Scottish Arts Council should have more representatives from minority ethnic groups both as members of staff and of committees and panels. They felt that an understanding of the complexity and

diversity involved in minority ethnic arts could only be achieved through employing more minority ethnic staff and increasing minority ethnic representation on Scottish Arts Council panels and committees.

- 7.3 One suggestion which given to assist the fund-raising process for organisations was the use of a common application form by various funding bodies. It was felt that this would ease the task of applying for funding as there were many different sources of funding, each of which required applicants to fill in a different form. Two organisations suggested that the Scottish Arts Council should visit the projects which they have funded in order to arrive at a better appreciation of the artistic activity supported; they were hopeful that this might facilitate their organisations' ability to access further funding.
- 7.4 A number of organisations focused on the Edinburgh Mela as representing the Scottish Arts Council's contribution to minority ethnic arts provision. For these organisations, the Mela is seen as the 'public face' of the Scottish Arts Council amongst minority ethnic groups. Two groups expressed the view that the Mela was predominantly South Asian and, as such, they wanted to see greater involvement from other minority ethnic communities.
- 7.5 Apart from providing more resources, it was felt that the Scottish Arts Council could play a useful role in supporting organisations to publicise their activities and in providing networking opportunities for organisations. Another role which was suggested for the Scottish Arts Council was the coordination of information on local artists who would be available to teach on an on-going basis, as well as visiting artists who might be able to offer master classes or workshops.

## **8. LINKS WITH LOCAL AUTHORITIES**

- 8.1 Examples of support and collaboration from a few local authorities in relation to the provision of premises and practical support with publicising events were clearly evident. One organisation had obtained considerable funding and support from the local authority which had also supported them in obtaining Scottish Arts Council funding. Close collaboration with the local authority seemed to have become part of the working practice of the organisation:

*'Yes, yes, yes. We feel very encouraged by X Council.'*

## **9. VISION FOR THE FUTURE**

- 9.1 Most organisations responded with general reflections on the importance of the arts as a means of promoting social inclusion. Some spoke of the future of their own organisations, and the need to develop and expand through practical advice and networking. Another vision for the future was an aspiration for minority ethnic artistic activities to be brought to the forefront of public awareness, alongside mainstream arts:

*'The performance... should be more mainstream or more in mainstream venues so that it becomes the sort of thing that people are used to going to, not something out of the way that seems a bit odd, or a bit quirky.'*

*'I think there is a rich treasure, which is hidden, but it will be lost if we don't work towards it to find it and the best way to find this treasure which is hidden is to try to bring people together and to respect them as well.'*

## **KEY FINDINGS**

1. The aims of minority ethnic arts organisations vary. Organisations interviewed can be divided into three types: 'cultural' (those concerned with maintaining a cultural inheritance); 'arts led' (those concerned primarily with art for its own sake); 'art therapy' (those concerned with using the arts for healing purposes).
2. Artistic activities organised by such organisations were diverse, attracting a wide range of participants.
3. A major gap which was identified was the lack of an appropriate venue for organising classes and rehearsals.
4. The lack of funding for salaried posts in minority ethnic organisations is a major barrier to growth. Minority ethnic arts organisations that have no paid staff have little chance to develop, and to compete on equal terms with other organisations that employ paid staff.
5. Minority ethnic arts organisations lack information on the range of funding opportunities available and knowledge of funding applications.
6. Minority ethnic organisations would welcome direct contact with funding bodies. They would like to see more minority ethnic staff representatives and would appreciate advice and assistance on funding applications and feedback on their applications.
7. Definitions of what constitutes 'the arts' between funding bodies and minority ethnic organisations may differ.
8. Minority ethnic organisations would like to have more contact with each other and welcome opportunities for networking.
9. Minority ethnic organisations had received little formal training and lacked information on areas in which training would be useful.
10. Many minority ethnic organisations had no knowledge of the Scottish Arts Council, and expressed an interest in establishing contact.
11. Some minority ethnic organisations had established links with local authorities, which provided them with some form of support.

## CHAPTER 4: PERSPECTIVES OF ARTISTS OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORIGIN

### 1 BACKGROUND

- 1.1 Six artists of minority ethnic origin were interviewed. Their backgrounds differed in terms of the following factors:
- Age, ethnicity, gender and sexuality
  - First and second generation, and length of residency
  - Artistic medium
  - Style, ranging from classical to contemporary
  - Income from artistic activity, ranging from entire income to no income
- 1.2 The artists interviewed worked in the following areas: writing (novels and poetry); digital photography; Islamic calligraphy; painting (acrylics and oil); writing, poetry and dance (Khatak); photography and fine art.
- 1.3 The training they had received in the arts ranged from self-trained to informal and formal training. This included working as an academic in the field of literature, attending writing workshops or courses at art college, being part of a writers' group, receiving informal coaching from another artist of minority ethnic origin, and professional training in classical dance.
- 1.4 One of the main motivating factors for engaging in artistic activity was self-expression. Other motivating factors were the desire to excel in a particular art-form, to gain a sense of achievement, to engage in a cathartic process, to communicate to a wider audience and to leave behind a legacy:
- 'I am constantly trying to push myself to write better stories, to do better, ...just push the boundaries in some way.'*
- 'Women artists have to claim space for themselves, I want my name there with everyone else.'*
- 'The purpose is to be heard and to be a voice to people with similar experiences'*
- 'Art never dies, never fades away ...I want my paintings to be in the museums...I want people to know that was (name of artist)'s painting'*
- 1.5 Perceptions about the status of minority ethnic art in Scotland tended to concur that it was low, and that while there were emerging signs of interest in this area, much remained to be done to encourage the development of such art. One example which was given to support this perception was the lack of paintings by artists of minority ethnic origin in Scottish art galleries.

## 2 CULTURAL IDENTITY AND ARTISTIC ACTIVITY

2.1 With one exception, the artists interviewed considered their cultural and ethnic identity to be of key importance to their work. Four different views emerged with regard to the importance of cultural and ethnic identity: psychological, political, historical and representation of modern reality. These views are summarised below to illustrate the value and relevance of promoting cultural diversity in Scottish arts.

(i) Art is a means of exploring and affirming cultural identity Several artists discussed the psychological motivation of art, as a means of exploring issues related to identity. For instance, through her work, one artist affirms the identity of second generation British Muslims who must accommodate religious values while living in British society. This artist produces works of Islamic calligraphy, using contemporary styles and media:

*'It can be a modern piece of work and it can have a religious message in that without having to be a traditional piece...And then I think that's helping younger people .....You can still be British but still be a British Muslim.'*

(ii) Art is a means of exploring views of ethnicity and confronting what it is to be non-white in a predominantly white society For at least three of the artists, producing art is not just about affirming identity but also about questioning and confronting negative stereotypes and racist assumptions. For these artists, art is overtly political. One of the artists is working on a project about the lack of representation of black people in the Scottish Parliament. Another artists talks about the role which art can play in raising awareness of the enduring nature of Scotland's multi-cultural population:

*"Well, I'll ask you then, what is the role of art in society? Is it a commodity to be marketed and somebody makes a profit? Is it a personal expression of particular space and time? Is it a method of demonstration and protest? I mean, it is a hundred and one things. The unique contribution I see of ethnic minority arts is not so much that it is ethnic minority but the fact that different issues are explored and expressed...[and that includes] having to recognise that ethnicity is here for good."*

(iii) Art is an expression of historical circumstances One of the artists refers to herself as an internationalist and makes a link between her own presence and work in Scotland, and British colonial history. This artist points to the wider historical context of British colonialism in which Scotland is inevitably situated. She makes the point that minority ethnic arts are not 'other', but part of British history and culture:

*"[It's not just] the fact that we're of different colour, and the fact that we wear more colours; it's nothing to do with that. It's to do with the fact that Britain had an empire and because they had an empire, we're here. They*

*were there, that's why we're here. It's cultural exchange and nothing patronising."*

(iv) Art represents a modern reality which includes ethnic and cultural complexity  
This view of the role of art is based on the perspective that ethnic and cultural complexity is an intrinsic part of modern reality. A novelist interviewed for the study, who draws on myths and mythologies from other cultures, as well as his own, saw himself as similar to, rather than different from, other writers:

*'I mean I'm a magpie; I'm a cultural magpie...artists are magpies I think you'll find that. A lot of artists kind of draw on different things actually, even if they don't admit it to themselves, that's what they're doing, you know.'*

### **3 LINKS WITH ORGANISATIONS**

3.1 Support received by the artists from minority ethnic organisations varied. One artist had gained considerable support from two minority ethnic organisations in relation to exhibitions of her work. A further four of the participants had well-established links with such organisations as teachers and workshop leaders, and three respondents were in fact founding members. General moral support was implicit in the discussion of their work with them, but the overall impression was that the artists contributed more support than they received.

3.2 Generally, the artists felt they had relatively little contact with mainstream organisations. The two artists who spoke positively about working with mainstream organisations had both been brought up in Britain, with one commenting that artists who did not have a British upbringing might be at a disadvantage in communicating with mainstream organisations. At different points throughout the interviews, all of the artists expressed a wish for greater collaboration with mainstream organisations, and for their work to be included alongside other Scottish artists. It was clear that they themselves saw much potential for such collaboration. Several artists suggested that more events should be organised with the aim of encouraging cultural diversity in the arts. At least one artist lacked confidence in making the first move:

*'They (mainstream organisation) have not asked me (to participate). I would'*

3.3 None of the artists felt able to comment on the quality of service provided by the Scottish Arts Council for minority ethnic artists. Two of the artists had received funding from the Scottish Arts Council. At least one artist who was currently taking a degree at an art college, wished for more advice and contact with the Scottish Arts Council:

*'I don't understand how their funding is allocated. I would like someone to come out to a place like this and give advice to people.'*

3.4 Generally, artists wished to be primarily recognized for their work as artists.

There were mixed views about the benefits of a targeting approach to funding, for instance through schemes specifically for artists of minority ethnic origin. Some felt they did not want to identify themselves, and for others to identify them, primarily in terms of their ethnicity. Others perceived the benefits of such targeted funding to be a means of facilitating access to funding, and gaining recognition for their work. One artist, who had tried unsuccessfully to obtain funding from two funding bodies, reported that she would prefer to apply for a grant that was specifically for minority ethnic artists because then, at least, if she was turned down, she would know it was not related to discrimination due to her ethnic origin.

#### **4. WORKING AS AN ARTIST**

4.1 Two of the artists interviewed receive their entire income from their work as an artist. When asked about professional opportunities, the artists were unanimous with regard to the difficulties of earning a living from their work, but did not perceive themselves to be different from other Scottish artists in this regard.

4.2 Although they recognised shared experiences with other Scottish artists, all six artists maintained that there were also differences in the professional experiences of those from a minority ethnic background:

*'If you're an ethnic minority you seem to have to make yourself be seen or heard; you don't seem to have anybody out there that will...take you seriously; you have to prove yourself more, just generally, in everything that you do...You do seem to see people – other people – having opportunities.'*

A number of the artists expressed the view that they themselves, or their work, were not always taken seriously:

*'I go to art class and it's not related to the work I do but I'd mentioned this work (Islamic calligraphy) and nobody took it seriously at all...They [said] "All right, okay, is that what you do, great" – you know – they didn't think much of it at all'*

A recurrent theme was that, if one excelled in one's work, it was possible to get beyond prejudice and discrimination:

*'I think if you're a good artist, they all respect you. If you're a really, really good artist, they all respect you – not thinking you're black or you are Chinese or you are anyone.'*

4.3 Several artists talked about greater opportunities for people from minority ethnic groups in England and particularly London. This was attributed in part to a bigger market for art generally, to the greater proportion of minority ethnic people in the population, and to cultural and historical issues:



*'I think Scotland is still struggling to be recognised in its own right as a nation which has its own national literature. It will establish that first before it will ...have space and time for other writers in a bigger way.'*

## **5. PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT**

- 5.1 All of the artists regarded other artists within their own field as their peers. Throughout the interviews, the artists placed an emphasis on their artistic medium rather than their role as representatives of a particular ethnicity or culture. They expressed concern that they be judged for their work:

*'Well, I'm not an expert on it so I'm not aware of all the different ramifications of the black and minority art or anything. I can only speak for myself really. I mean basically I would like to see myself as a writer...not a black writer, or an Asian writer, you know what I mean? Because I think that limits you'*

- 5.2 Several artists mentioned the importance of opportunities to promote their work alongside other Scottish artists who were not of minority ethnic origin, for example, alongside other writers, dancers or painters. This was seen as a very important means of developing an audience for their work within the general public.

- 5.3 Generally, a key issue for artists was the visibility of their work in the Scottish arts sector. Depending on the artistic activity they were engaged in, artists faced specific barriers which restricted their professional development. For example, a key issue for writers was access to publishers, and better distribution of their work, while visual artists struggled to find opportunities to exhibit their work in galleries and other places:

*'This is the thing, we don't have the opportunity. And you can't just go and open up a gallery and say 'this is me'. And going to the Mela once a year, it's not much really.'*

## **6. CONTACT WITH THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AND PERCEPTIONS OF ITS ROLE**

- 6.1 Artists varied in the contact which they had established with the Scottish Arts Council from those who had only heard of the organisation to those who had some knowledge of the organisation and had succeeded in obtaining some funding from it.

- 6.2 Artists interviewed saw a role for the Scottish Arts Council in several areas:

- Financial support in the form of bursaries
- Help with publicising their work through, for example, facilitating access to publishers, or support with putting up exhibitions of their work
- Making available a physical space which would serve as a centre for their work, either on an on-going basis or at regular intervals

- Providing greater access to information about existing opportunities
- Providing greater support of community arts projects
- Establishing more contact with projects which they had funded
- Conducting outreach work to art colleges and schools as well as the projects which they had funded.

## **7. VISION FOR THE FUTURE**

- 7.1. Visions for the future were varied and included committees and staff in the Scottish Arts Council which were more representative of minority ethnic communities, a higher profile accorded to artistic activity which is associated with organisations and artists from these communities, greater exposure to such art for young children of all backgrounds and the inclusion of artists from minority ethnic communities in all policies and activities undertaken by the Scottish Arts Council.

### **KEY FINDINGS**

1. Artists from a minority ethnic background articulated clear views on the value and relevance of cultural diversity in the arts in Scotland, and of the links between ethnic and cultural identity and the arts.
2. The artists consulted for this research did not want to be primarily identified as coming from a minority ethnic group and wished to be recognised for the value of their work. However, some felt that targeting of funds might be necessary to ensure access to financial support.
3. The artists interviewed expressed a keen desire for greater visibility of their work through more opportunities for promoting their work along with other Scottish artists and more inclusive events.

## **CHAPTER 5: PERSPECTIVES OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS**

### **1 BACKGROUND**

- 1.1 The perspectives reported in this chapter are largely drawn from interviews with local authorities (3), mainstream arts organisations (4) and a development agency (1). These were located in Scotland's four cities (Glasgow, Edinburgh, Aberdeen and Dundee) which have the largest concentration of minority ethnic people and in one area which has a small and dispersed minority ethnic population (Inverness).
- 1.2 Those interviewed primarily included senior management, with some representation from staff with more specific responsibility for community involvement, education and wider access.
- 1.3 The definition of 'culturally diverse communities' was raised. One view was that the Year of Cultural Diversity in 2002 should adopt a broad definition, which includes any culture that has an impact on the city/region and which recognises and celebrates the variety of cultural origins in a community.

### **2 LOCAL AUTHORITIES' WORK WITHIN A CULTURALLY DIVERSE CONTEXT**

- 2.1 A short postal survey of all thirty two local authorities sought to elicit information on capital and revenue funding allocated to artistic activity by minority ethnic organisations and artists from a minority ethnic background. This revealed that, of the 25 authorities which responded, 14 did not make any relevant awards within the last three years. 9 authorities reported funding projects, and of these the City of Glasgow and City of Edinburgh Council provided by far the largest funding programmes (at least £259,664 and £158,297, respectively). West Lothian was the only other authority to provide grants amounting to over £50,000. Aberdeen City Council, East Renfrewshire, Highland, East Dunbartonshire and Stirling reported providing grants under £10,000. Dundee City Council also reported providing funding to 3 projects.
- 2.2 The rest of this section reports on the findings revealed by interviews with local authority arts officers. These indicate that differences in funding provision may be viewed against a background in which there are differences in approach and emphasis in relation to the roles played by local authorities in arts provision in general, and in arts provision for, by and with minority ethnic communities in particular. Some of these differences relate to their geographical location, the concentration of minority ethnic people living in the area, and the extent to which they are engaged in direct and indirect service provision.
- 2.3 Among the local authorities surveyed, a broad range of arts activities and events were supported across geographical communities and communities of interest, including both professional and amateur groups. Such support included the managing of grants, advice and information services for clients, providing

information to the general public, commenting on lottery applications and liaising with other council departments and other statutory service providers.

- 2.4 Not surprisingly, the local authorities in Glasgow and Edinburgh, areas where minority ethnic people are mainly concentrated, had more established links with minority ethnic communities and more extensive experience of working with them. As was clear from the results of the postal survey, an important element of the work of these authorities in relation to promoting cultural diversity was through funding a range of initiatives.
- 2.5 The funding of such initiatives was encouraged by establishing links and developing partnerships with minority ethnic organisations. However, the extent to which local authorities adopted a pro-active approach to identifying the full range of artistic activity within minority ethnic communities and encouraging applications from minority ethnic organisations varied, with one local authority reporting a recent shift from outreach work to development work. Similarly, the extent to which efforts to publicise material related to the availability of grants to those who were not able to speak English varied. There was some awareness that minority ethnic organisations which were heavily reliant on volunteers may need more assistance with filling in funding applications forms.
- 2.6 Funded initiatives were monitored through funding agreements which described specific proposals and the objectives which were to be achieved. Monitoring in this area included the venues used, the audience attracted, the box office income obtained and the identification of any issues which needed to be taken into account in future initiatives. This took place within a context where performance management systems were reported to be integral to the work of local authorities. This included monitoring the number of organisations worked with, the proportion of the budget spent, the amount of Officer contact and the number of Officers who were involved and the range of activities which were either funded or directly provided.
- 2.7 All those living in rural areas are affected by geographical distance and lack of public transport in relation to arts attendance and participation. However, there was a perception that minority ethnic groups living in these areas might face particular problems, due to the small and dispersed nature of the population and the lack of information and knowledge about the artistic needs and aspirations of these communities:
- 'if you are not reaching people, and in the absence of any research, I can only hypothesise really as to why we might not know about additional activity or unsatisfied demands.'*
- 2.8 Promoting and organising tours by visiting groups from other parts of the UK as well as from abroad was seen as an effective means of raising awareness of living in a multi-cultural society in areas in which there were small numbers of minority ethnic people. One local authority raised the issue of travelling communities, and the relevance of the Gaelic language within a culturally diverse context, particularly in the north of Scotland.

- 2.9 An important part of the remit of at least two local authorities was reported to be identifying gaps in provision and developing targeted initiatives to fill these gaps. One means of doing this was by encouraging collaborative work between various organisations. One example given was establishing linkages between a Social Inclusion Partnership project which works with children in care and four arts organisations to encourage children who are leaving care to consider the arts either as a hobby or as a profession.
- 2.10 Apart from providing funding, additional support which was provided by some local authorities to minority ethnic organisations included making venues and facilities available and practical support, such as help with publicity and providing information about organisations and artists.
- 2.11 Challenges among local authority arts officers in terms of improving arts provision for minority ethnic communities were seen to include acquiring greater knowledge of the groups they were working with, different ways in which these groups expressed, or could potentially express themselves through the arts, and improving the means of establishing contact with communities. A recurrent theme was the need for caution in identifying community interests and aspirations through the individuals who put themselves forward; it was felt that it could not be assumed that such individuals represented wider community interests.

### **3 LOCAL AUTHORITIES' PERCEPTIONS OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS**

- 3.1 Local authorities recognised the existence of a diverse range of minority ethnic organisations carrying out regular programmes with a core audience. They also perceived a growing awareness among a number of mainstream organisations of the benefits of collaborating with such organisations. The presence of asylum-seekers was perceived as an opportunity to develop such provision.
- 3.2 Some of the weaknesses of provision by minority ethnic organisations were related to weaknesses in the infrastructure of such organisations. One or two individuals in minority ethnic arts organisations were often reported to carry the responsibility of attracting funding and perceived to be 'creaking under the pressure.' When such individuals moved on, they left a vacuum which could not be easily filled.
- 3.3 Difficulties experienced by local authorities in relation to working with minority ethnic organisations included the lack of information provided by these organisations about their formal structures, their lack of experience in relation to complying with funding mechanisms and their lack of awareness of the need to be accountable for the funding allocated.
- 3.4 The need for capacity building and sustained development of minority ethnic organisations by funding bodies was strongly made by more than one local authority officer:

*'We wouldn't ask out mainstream organisations to stand up on a stage and do ten minutes and then disappear. Its moving from a quick hit*

*showcase parade, carnival attitude to something that is more bedded in how a community within a community expresses itself*

*'We need to be working much more towards building a capacity of organisations to do more sustainable work, to reach a higher quality, to then present bigger projects, which will make an impact'*

#### **4 MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS' WORK WITHIN CULTURALLY DIVERSE CONTEXTS**

- 4.1 In general, the main forms of direct artistic provision by those interviewed ranged widely from putting on quality productions and exhibitions to organising tours of visiting artists. Central Belt providers operated in the context of many other artistic and developmental organisations providing distinct but related services. Some organisations with rural ties noted the existence of areas which were not served by arts provision at all, even for the majority population. Many mainstream organisations also saw their role as providing other services, such as developing new educational and outreach initiatives, being a community resource and hosting community arts programmes.
- 4.2 Gaps in general arts provision were highlighted, the content of which was specific to the different cities and towns of the interviewees. Physical gaps listed included the following: a professional studio theatre; a small/medium music venue; a dance centre; generally well-equipped facilities and rehearsal spaces and studio provision for makers of all kinds.
- 4.3 Mainstream organisations in the north of Scotland raised the major issues of indigenous languages, travellers' communities, religious histories and wider definitions of cultural diversity, all of which were seen to impact on the parameters for cultural development in that area, and to impinge on any discussion and policymaking in relation to minority ethnic arts and communities.
- 4.4 Most mainstream organisations had worked with a variety of culturally diverse organisations and individuals. This included specially-commissioned work that was core to their activity, as well as 'opportunistic' programming building on funding schemes available at a particular time. The development of work that grew out of a two-way exchange of ideas was often cited as resulting in successful initiatives.
- 4.5 One mainstream organisation interviewed had no experiences of working on projects which included artists from a minority ethnic background, while another had some but felt it had failed to build on them, due to time or financial restrictions. At the programming level, a lack of knowledge of the quality and intention in unfamiliar non-Western art forms was a factor which restricted mainstream organisations' ability to include such work.
- 4.6 The mainstream organisations interviewed were aware of extremely small numbers of minority ethnic artists in their field, particularly within the local area which they served. The clear lack of younger artists emerging into professional

creative fields suggested that there might be problems in terms of access to college training, for those art forms where training exists such as drama, music, design and visual art. As an example, during the recruitment process in the performing arts, some organisations could recall no graduates emerging from college who were from minority ethnic communities. Efforts to encourage awareness of potential careers for children at school level, which were backed by adequate resources, were seen as a means of addressing this situation.

4.7 A few mainstream organisations highlighted occasional projects encountering problems because of particular and local tensions within the participating communities that hampered smooth communication and collaboration with the organisation concerned. A recurring comment from mainstream organisations was that they had a sense or awareness of political and internal issues in minority ethnic communities, which made mainstream organisations wary of how best to make contact, for example, who to telephone first or whom to invite to perform or exhibit. This fear of 'stepping on toes', or entering blind into areas where competing interests operated seemed to be an inhibiting factor for those mainstream organisations who lacked established links with minority ethnic communities.

4.8 It was recognised that some of the minority ethnic artists which mainstream organisations chose to work with were those which had been pro-active in making contact with them, and that organisations have to broaden their own awareness. One view was that challenges with regard to fund-raising and different working patterns were not any different from the experience of working with mainstream projects.

4.9 A primary way in which mainstream organisations linked with minority ethnic artists and organisations was through proposals originating from minority ethnic communities in the first instance. Generally, the lack of visibility of minority ethnic groups in the eyes of mainstream organisations was recognised as an issue.

4.10 A number of organisations had worked successfully with artists from abroad, for example from Japan, ex-Soviet Union countries, Latin America and China. These tended in the main to have been made through well-established, official contacts such as UK agencies, whose remit is to set up international artistic visits, or through representation from cultural embassies from those countries seeking to promote work within the UK. In the case of performing arts collaborations among artists, this was described as particularly beneficial to both cultural groups:

*'some of the work we've done with Japanese artists has had a very positive impact because it's introduced us to a range of technical demands which we hadn't come across before, which is actually very positive.'*

4.11 The expense and rarity of touring groups from overseas, including culturally diverse artists, and the lack of suitable local venues (particularly in the area of performing arts) were mentioned as at least two factors which restricted more expansive programming of minority ethnic arts.

- 4.12 On rare occasions, organisations interviewed had initiated projects with minority ethnic artists out with their own artistic field to cultivate cross-arts interest, for example, minority ethnic music events in an art gallery.
- 4.13 A key point was how to create platforms – from one-off forums to more permanent structures - for people to come together and participate. Sensitivity to some community needs (in relation to gender, for instance) was seen to be essential. In the creation of such platforms, many organisations mentioned the benefit of having individuals with skills that crossed minority ethnic and mainstream cultural provision.
- 4.14 The use of specialist/dedicated art workers within communities developing projects, attracting money and sustaining group activity was a concrete suggestion, along with dedicated specialist staff posts with specific knowledge of minority ethnic communities working within mainstream organisations and local authorities, as an interface with minority ethnic communities and organisations.
- 4.15 Finding the time to set up programmes, fund-raise and build relationships with new groups was reported to be a difficulty for those working in the mainstream organisations interviewed. More positively, it was observed by some that longer term projects, intensive consultation and collaboration was often possible within education departments of the mainstream arts organisations, where these existed, although space and resources provision had to be considered.
- 4.16 There was a lack of firm statistical information on minority ethnic communities and reliable information on their needs, including, for instance, information relating to non-Western calendars/seasonal festivals.
- 4.17 There was a perception by representatives of mainstream organisations that the status of arts associated with minority ethnic cultures was low within Scotland or that it at least depended on the status of the venue which was promoting it. Negative comparisons to the status and activity of minority ethnic arts in England were made. Low status was linked by some to inadequate knowledge, that is, mainstream arts organisations and the general public were perceived by those interviewed as largely ignorant of good work coming from minority ethnic communities. For some though, arts associated with minority ethnic arts were identified as a strongly developing area. Another comment questioned the extent to which the Edinburgh International Festival encouraged cultural diversity, and therefore the status that non-Western arts were afforded.

## **5 MAINSTREAM ORGANISATIONS' LINKS WITH OTHER ORGANISATIONS**

- 5.1 All mainstream organisations interviewed have a large network with whom they work, from other art organisations and venues, to the Scottish Arts Council, their local authority (including social work and education departments), enterprise boards, local businesses, universities, community groups and health boards.
- 5.2 Established working links with minority ethnic groups was variable and where it occurred was related to specific projects, either international or education-led. Some organisations used 'intermediary' contacts, such as local authorities or



collaborative partners, to create links with minority ethnic communities. At best, some organisations consulted and collaborated regularly with local minority ethnic groups with whom they had good working relations.

*'it can be a two way process, and that together we can actually set up projects that are worthwhile. That's how it works with (minority ethnic organisation) - it's very much a partnership, it's a discussion about who might be available and what we can do with them and it's that kind of partnership that I think is required to really make something work and work well.'*

- 5.3 However, for at least one of the mainstream organisations, minority ethnic links was not a stated priority in terms of its core business, and as a result produced less collaborative or project activity.
- 5.4 Organisations with specific remits, such as Visiting Arts<sup>32</sup>, were seen as key to assisting contacts and funding, through information networks, grant schemes and directories. Direct visits to countries with artistic activity of potential interest were cited as beneficial in creating overseas links, though cost was a prohibitive factor.

## **6 PERCEPTIONS OF AUDIENCE DEVELOPMENT BY LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS**

- 6.1 The artistic and educational programmes on offer to audiences by mainstream arts organisations are wide-ranging, and have a general intention of catering for different types of audience.
- 6.2 According to some mainstream organisations' own perceptions and research, it was widely considered that economic groups ABC1s formed the main core audience bracket, and that echoed patterns in other parts of the UK. One organisation highlighted that its audience was drawn particularly from the 18-45 age bracket; by contrast, another reported that the age range was 3-83. Others, notably local authority arts officers, expressed considerable uncertainty relating to the identity of attendees and non-attendees across a wide range of venues, including community centres, in which arts events were organised. However, there was some consensus of opinion that:

*'the traditional structure by which arts are delivered are not necessarily sympathetic to any but a middle class, reasonably affluent audience with transport to access these facilities.'*

- 6.3 Most mainstream organisations acknowledged considerable scope for widening and extending their audience base, though varied in the specific initiatives they had undertaken to date. There was a sense that the number of individuals and groups worked with was large and there was a conscious process of identifying

---

<sup>32</sup> Visiting Arts is the UK national agency for promoting the flow of international arts into the UK and developing related cultural links abroad to help build cultural awareness and positive cultural relations. They cover all the performing arts, design, literature, film, architecture, visual, media and applied arts.

gaps, with targeted projects being initiated. Local authorities reported particular initiatives in this area such as attempts to encourage arts organisations to work with children in care, and through links with schools.

- 6.4 Most mainstream organisations felt their artform specialism was open to appreciation by a number of different groups. A very small number recognised that their artistic form was undeniably Western in origin, and therefore likely to be more easily assimilated by a Western audience. This brought challenges in terms of introducing culturally diverse strands and a certain nervousness about losing focus in current expertise. In such cases, the role of internal education departments, where these existed, was highlighted as a way of widening access.
- 6.5 There was not a very clear identification on the part of mainstream organisations and local authorities of why existing audiences attended a particular venue. There was awareness of general factors that acted as deterrents to attending arts events such as long working hours, admission charges, transport costs and the availability of a wide range of alternative forms of entertainment and home-based media.
- 6.6 There was also some awareness of very specific barriers that might stop certain sections of the community coming to events, such as elderly people not feeling it was safe to go to evening performances. Other less frequently attending groups were identified by mainstream organisations as non-arts literate, families with young children and youth groups.
- 6.7 Mainstream organisations also recognised a tendency towards cautious programming in some cases, chiefly for economic reasons and to ensure a high take up by audiences. According to one local authority officer, conservative programming by mainstream arts organisations closely reflected the largely conservative nature of audiences:

*'By and large you find that the audience the event attracts is the audience that you would expect it to attract ...the audience already knows it...that's a barrier to development because it means people play safe in terms of what they will present and what they will go and see'*

- 6.8 However, some mainstream arts organisations acknowledged that there was a lack of development work which would extend the audience base out with regular attendees or deeper into community groups, and which would cross art-forms and venues. One local authority officer perceived this to be true also of the minority ethnic organisations funded by the council whose audiences did not extend beyond a core audience from within their community:

*'how you broaden that out into much more flowing channels of communication between different projects, different audiences, different organisations is the big challenge'*

In contrast, another local authority officer pointed to Chinese New Year celebrations which were viewed as a mainstream event, and attributed this to an appetite in the wider community for learning about other cultures. Yet another

local authority officer anticipated that steps taken to increase the audience base might include identifying any latent demand, assessing levels of satisfaction with existing arts provision and considering the need for more targeted approaches. The usefulness of comparators in terms of approaches which had been employed in England to develop audiences for arts associated with minority ethnic cultures was also recognised.

- 6.9 An information gap was highlighted in the patterns of attendance of minority ethnic communities and a lack of knowledge concerning the factors which encouraged and limited their attendance at arts events. Lack of familiarity, relevance and comfort with Western art-forms were seen as possible deterrents for minority ethnic communities, although perhaps less so to younger people in these communities.
- 6.10 Mainstream organisations out with the Central Belt commented on the marked difference in population numbers of minority ethnic communities in their area, varying from small, scattered communities to single families only. Recent research on the invisibility of minority ethnic people, their difficulties in accessing provision and the existence of racism in rural Scotland was twice cited to be relevant to the current context.<sup>33</sup> The wider issues of geographical distance, lack of public transport and economic factors were common to all communities outside metropolitan centres.
- 6.11 Encouragingly, it was reported that when visiting performing artists from minority ethnic cultures had visited outlying and rural areas of Scotland, there had been great enthusiasm and high audience take-up on the events. More generally, work with international artists was seen to be important both in its own right and as a means of inspiring local artists. Local authority officers reported that challenges in this area included the sourcing of appropriate artists, the building up of relationships with intermediary agencies and encouraging mainstream organisations to work with such artists. Visiting Arts was seen as offering a model of good practice in this area.
- 6.12 Mailing lists seem to be the key publicity strategy employed by mainstream organisations, although many standard marketing techniques are used to raise awareness, including leafleting, advertising and seeking editorial copy. Word-of-mouth was seen as an important supplement to other forms of information. One point raised was that artistic work outside a mainstream organisation's usual core art-form might result in difficulties in supporting that work through marketing effectively to new constituencies.
- 6.13 A common remark was that a trusted mechanism needed to be found in order for a mainstream organisation to be able to communicate effectively with culturally diverse audiences:

*'if there is a way in which possibilities can be opened up for organisations which perhaps have much narrower horizons than they should, and*

---

<sup>33</sup> De Lima, P (2001) *Needs not numbers: An exploratory study of the experiences of minority ethnic groups in rural Scotland*, London: Commission for Racial Equality

*they're then led through in developing communications with groups, that will demonstrate the potential.'*

## **7 TRAINING AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS**

- 7.1 Most training/skills within local authorities and mainstream organisations in relation to minority ethnic communities and arts associated with them have been self-taught, through practical experience. In general, specific, formal training in this area was recognised as rather ad hoc.
- 7.2 A regular training programme and discussion platform aimed at disseminating good practice and updating knowledge was perceived to be useful. It was noted that training in other contexts, such as working with children and the mentally ill, is more readily available and taken up. One comment was that training should come from expert individuals within the communities themselves and not from those less directly involved.
- 7.3 A point was raised by mainstream organisations that in considering the question of training needs, there was a need for preliminary advice on what the priority areas are perceived to be.
- 7.4 On a related point, some programming heads in mainstream organisations felt the need for easy access to information on the availability of minority ethnic-related work, as the field is complex and wide. This was supported by local authority officers who pointed to the importance of centrally coordinating information on minority ethnic artistic activity, especially in the context of increasing the benefits to be obtained from tours by visiting artists.
- 7.5 Examples of good practice in developing artistic programming that was aware of minority ethnic issues were also perceived by mainstream organisations to be useful.
- 7.6 Exceptionally, some organisations employed individual artists, for example, musicians who were trained in working with culturally diverse groups as part of educational programmes.

## **8 STRATEGIC CONTEXT OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS**

- 8.1 Local authorities generally reported that work related to cultural diversity was undertaken within a policy context, which included the National Cultural Strategy produced by the Scottish Executive, arts policies which encouraged equal opportunities, and legislation such as the Human Rights Act, the Race Relations Amendment Act and the Disability Discrimination Act. However, one local authority reported that while its arts strategy made specific reference to Gaelic and issues relating to travellers, no specific mention was made to increasing access to the arts by minority ethnic communities.

- 8.2 The strategic context of mainstream organisations interviewed ranged widely, from being aware of Diversity 2002 and the general policy increase in this area, to being completely unaware of any Scottish Arts Council policy in this area or unsure whether it was ACE or Scottish Arts Council policies they had read. Local authority policies related to increasing access to minority ethnic communities were known of in some instances, but not universally.
- 8.3 For many of the mainstream organisations interviewed, it was important to plan for cross-cultural strands in their programme, as they had an international remit. However, this was usually not specific in relation to arts activity which was related to minority ethnic communities. Consequently, it was uncommon for the organisations concerned to have a strategy, action plan or targets in relation to minority ethnic communities. The main reason for the omission was that this was not an area that they were currently required by funders to address and measure. No other reasons were given and there was no indication by any organisation interviewed that strategies, action plans or targets in this area would be unwelcome or undesirable. There was, however, some general feeling that small organisations lacked resources for instigating wider action plans and targets, which might more appropriately be a requirement of larger organisations in the sector in general.
- 8.4 Some mainstream organisations were aware their established infrastructures did not necessarily take account of a more expanded and inclusive view of cultural activity, including within the amateur sector. A wider remit within which culturally diverse artistic activity might be contextualised might include activities which had hitherto been neglected, for example, the crafts and community or participatory theatre.

## **9 LINKS WITH THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AND LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS**

- 9.1 Two local authorities reported close strategic links with the Scottish Arts Council in increasing access and participation in the arts by minority ethnic communities at a number of levels, and across art-forms. This has taken the form of participation in a Scottish Arts Council-organised cultural diversity working group, working in partnership to draw up strategic documents, joint funding agreements and one jointly-funded cultural diversity post. Such close links have resulted in substantial increases in the financial input of the local authorities concerned and of the Scottish Arts Council in the area of cultural diversity. Fewer strategic links were reported by the third authority with respect to promoting cultural diversity, although it maintained links in relation to other specific on-going projects and through the HI arts partnership which included the local authority, the Scottish Arts Council, Highlands and Islands Enterprise and a tourist office. This last partnership was seen as providing a useful context within which strategic links to promote cultural diversity could be developed.
- 9.2 Mainstream organisations had very close links with their corresponding department in the Scottish Arts Council and more broad contact through their education departments, where these existed, with the Scottish Arts Council education department. Consequently all organisations felt very up to date with

more general information from the Scottish Arts Council. However, mainstream organisations varied in relation to the links they had with the Scottish Arts Council on minority ethnic arts areas, from close collaboration on policy ideas to no knowledge of what the Council provides or requires.

9.3 There was an observation from some mainstream organisations, particularly those working outside the Central Belt, that any Scottish Arts Council policies in relation to arts associated with minority ethnic communities should demonstrate sensitivity in terms of geographical and cultural factors. This observation was relevant to assessing training needs and designing the content of training programmes, where urban/rural sensitivities had to be borne in mind, whether in relation to training staff within mainstream organisations or practitioners in the field.

9.4 Local authority and arts officers noted that the new dedicated Scottish Arts Council staff member working on minority ethnic arts provision had already provided a source of encouragement and information that was useful to mainstream organisations. This went some way in fulfilling the Scottish Arts Council role to demonstrate potential and open up possibilities in the sector that could be enacted by cultural organisations themselves:

*'a lot of it is that kind of showing what's possible, which a national agency can do more easily than a local one'*

A move by the Scottish Arts Council from reactive provider, expressed in many funding schemes, to proactive provider, with more flexibility and targeted encouragement, was stated by some as a positive development.

9.5 Another useful role which the Scottish Arts Council could play in relation to supporting international artists was to act as an arbiter through working with national and international agencies, facilitating the development of a touring network, disseminating information about visiting groups and promoters and facilitating useful linkages.

## **10 OTHER OBSERVATIONS**

10.1 There was felt to be a need to be clear on two distinct but related strands of action with regard to audiences and participation. One strand is targeted support for minority ethnic cultural activity in its own right, in order to increase minority ethnic communities' ability to participate in the arts sector. The second strand of action is that directed to mainstream organisations in order to develop culturally diverse arts programming for the benefit of all. Despite the need for broad approaches, the view was expressed that different structures and policies would be needed to implement these two strands.

10.2 Many officers/staff working in both local authorities and mainstream organisations felt that there existed a somewhat nebulous vision of a future in which culturally diverse arts activity and easy access to culture across many audiences should and would become a 'natural' and integral part of the cultural landscape:

*'when the mainstream is able to recognise and value the contribution of diverse cultures and minority ethnic people are able to feel at home with the mainstream culture'*

Others highlighted that this could only be achieved through sustained commitment to this area:

*'The main thing is the long-term development capacity...rather than the quick fix approach....because there are huge complexities, because there are so many different approaches, different expectations and I think we do a disservice if we simply accept what's immediately offered.'*

#### **KEY FINDINGS**

1. Significant variations exist in the approach taken by local authorities in relation to supporting cultural diversity in the arts. To some extent, but not universally, this was related to the concentration of minority ethnic people living in the area.
2. All the mainstream organisations consulted had examples of productive and creative collaborations with minority ethnic communities, although on different levels of engagement.
3. Few mainstream organisations had specific targets or goals in relation to minority ethnic communities.
4. It was generally agreed that there were considerable opportunities and potential for expanding work with minority ethnic communities and in widening the programme mix.
5. General support for developing sustainable and deeper collaboration and partnerships in this area, rather than 'one-offs', was expressed.
6. There was widespread absence of training with regard to minority ethnic communities within mainstream organisations and local authorities.
7. Awareness of national and local strategies regarding minority ethnic arts, and the nature of strategic links, including those with the Scottish Arts Council, was variable.

## CHAPTER 6: PERSPECTIVES FROM THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL

### 1 BACKGROUND AND GENERAL VIEWS ABOUT THE DRAFT CULTURAL DIVERSITY POLICY (CDP)

- 1.1 This chapter reports on two focus group meetings which were held with 10 members of staff from the Scottish Arts Council and 5 members of committees.
- 1.2 The status of the policy was unclear to some participants, as was the extent of consultation which had taken place. It was clarified that the existing policy was a draft policy, and that consultation within the Scottish Arts Council was in its early stages.
- 1.3 Some elements of the policy were identified as aspirational. One of the perceived strengths of the policy was that it was an acknowledgement that it was important to support cultural diversity, which had not always been made clear in the past.
- 1.4 It was felt that one limitation of the policy was that it did not engage with the majority population in relation to arts associated with minority ethnic cultures, and that it should aim to enhance the experiences of the majority population, as well as satisfy the aspirations of the minority ethnic population:

*'it doesn't engage with the Scottish population as a whole in terms of fair exposure to the art that is produced by ethnic minorities in Scotland. That is a missed opportunity and... should be stated explicitly.'*

*'surely the two things we would want the policy to do is to firstly satisfy the aspirations of the ethnic minorities themselves, and secondly to assist in enhancing the experience of the non-ethnic (sic) community'*

- 1.5 It was reported that the Scottish Arts Council had recently undergone major structural and organisational change. There had also been a shift in recent years from a concentration of policies which were directed to particular art-forms, towards broader social policies, such as social inclusion policies (including the disability and the draft cultural diversity policy). Staff were still learning and taking on board the implications of these policies:

*'we are going through a considerable process of change at the moment, because in the past...policy was very much related to specific art-forms so it evolved very much from individual art form departments...but then in recent years we've actually been looking at issues which are not art...but are emerging from broader cultural issues...So there is bound to be some difficulty, at least in the first stages of relating the broad policy, social policy sweeps with a specific art form.'*

- 1.6 Currently, it was felt that the Scottish Arts Council operates in a 'neutral' manner in that none of its schemes excludes minority ethnic communities or disabled people. This was seen by some to be an inclusive approach. However, others pointed out that operating from a supposedly neutral basis did not ensure equality of access.



- 1.7 It was felt that a period of information gathering was required which involved listening and reviewing activities, the identification of practical constraints and the identification of needs and aspirations of different ethnic groups, including older and younger people.
- 1.8 There was also perceived to be a need for careful monitoring of the policy once implemented and for the identification of appropriate performance indicators. Training of Scottish Arts Council staff in terms of minority ethnic artistic activity and existing constraints was also required.

## **2 VIEWS ABOUT MAINSTREAMING**

- 2.1 Some discussion took place around the benefits of a mainstreaming approach in which all aspects of policy and practice sought to take into account the needs and aspirations of minority ethnic communities versus that of a targeted approach in which specific policies and activities attempted to meet the needs and aspirations of these communities.
- 2.2 It was reported that in the past, there had been opposition to a targeted approach and the setting up of a separate committee and a separate fund for cultural diversity on the grounds that this might 'ghettoise' minority ethnic participation in the arts. Some recent positive action in this area had led to the appointment of a black and minority ethnic arts officer whose remit would cut across all art-form teams.
- 2.3 It was recognised that there was a need for a two-pronged approach which included mainstreaming as well as positive action to address neglected areas in the short term.

## **3 ROLE OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AS A FUNDING BODY**

- 3.1 Initiatives which the Scottish Arts Council had funded in the past and which were seen to be successful included those in which minority ethnic communities had been closely involved, for example, through collaboration with the Fruitmarket Gallery, the Lemon Tree and the Pollockshields project. However, there were varying views as to what constituted 'success', which took into account whether events were staged as planned, the impact of the event as well as qualitative aspects of the provision. For example, events might take place as planned but the quality might be disappointing.
- 3.2 One view was that minority ethnic applicants did not effectively promote themselves:

*'there definitely are a higher proportion among this group against the ordinary group of people whose applications don't sell themselves – don't put forward their own best case.'*

- 3.3 Participants expressed an interest in identifying difficulties encountered by minority ethnic applicants, which were additional to those generally faced by most first time applicants. Such information would be useful in considering whether pre-application support should be made available, and if so, to what extent.
- 3.4 Another barrier to accessing Scottish Arts Council funding seemed to be external perceptions about what the Scottish Arts Council might wish to fund. It is possible that erroneous assumptions of what the Scottish Arts Council is likely to fund in the future may be formed on the basis of what has been previously funded.
- 3.5 An area of concern for the Scottish Arts Council was to ensure that it could access appropriate expertise in order to assess the quality of applications from minority ethnic applicants relating to certain art-forms. This was related to different levels of knowledge of the values on which minority ethnic art was based. Artistic quality and innovation were usually key criteria in assessing funding applications; it was sometimes not clear to Scottish Arts Council staff on what basis applications from minority ethnic applicants should be judged:
- 'it is much less clear how to assess quality when the art is coming from a different set of values'*
- 3.6 Existing assumptions among Scottish Arts Council staff in relation to the nature of artistic activity which might be funded might also act as a barrier to the access of funding by minority ethnic applicants. For example, although Asian writers had been supported by bursaries, these had been largely awarded to those who were writing in the English language, as opposed to those writing in Asian languages, such as Urdu.
- 3.7 It was noted that there was great diversity between the minority ethnic communities, for example, between the travelling population and the South Asian population. There was also considerable diversity in the artistic aspirations of minority ethnic populations, including a strong desire to preserve traditional culture and art, as well as a keen interest in innovation. It was felt that since it would be difficult to satisfy all the aspirations of minority ethnic communities, some prioritisation for the deployment of resources was likely to be required.
- 3.8 There was some discussion around whether the schemes which currently operated in the Scottish Arts Council encouraged equal access to the arts by all. It was noted that two schemes had been recently introduced to promote social inclusion: the Strategic Development Fund and the Diversity 2002 Fund.
- 3.9 There were conflicting views as to whether existing schemes would promote cultural diversity. It was suggested that a reduction in the number of specific schemes and the introduction of broader schemes might facilitate access to funding by minority ethnic applicants, by allowing them greater scope to satisfy their artistic aspirations.
- 3.10 An opposing view was that existing schemes provided a useful basis for assessing applications and for promoting artistic activity in certain areas, and that their removal would make it more difficult to promote cultural diversity.

*'If you do reduce the schemes it actually becomes more difficult because there are a wider range of variables you can get right...it can actually make the competition worse for non-mainstream'*

- 3.11 It was suggested that a two way education process was required. The Scottish Arts Council should strive for a better understanding and appreciation of the artistic activities and aspirations of minority ethnic communities and some minority ethnic applicants need to acquire a better understanding of the formal structures of the application process.

#### **4 ROLE OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL AS ADVOCATE**

- 4.1 It was suggested that the Scottish Arts Council play a 'consciousness raising' role and support, encourage and create the framework for increased participation in the arts in general from minority ethnic communities.
- 4.2 Some participants suggested that the CDP offered the Scottish Arts Council the opportunity to be a model of good practice in the promotion of cultural diversity for mainstream arts organisations in Scotland. It was perceived that the Arts Council of England was further ahead in promoting cultural diversity, in terms of providing information, training and support.

#### **5 ROLE OF THE SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL IN PROVIDING A SUPPORTIVE INFRASTRUCTURE**

- 5.1 The Scottish Arts Council was perceived as playing a role in improving the skills of those working in the arts which are related to the promotion of cultural diversity.
- 5.2 One area in which it was felt that the Scottish Arts Council could play a useful role in promoting cultural diversity was by facilitating the entry of international artists and clarifying the terms and conditions under which they were allowed to work.
- 5.3 Some participants felt that organisations which are core-funded by the Scottish Arts Council could be encouraged to promote the CDP through funding agreements in which the promotion of cultural diversity in their catchment area is made a condition of funding. For example, organisations which support writers and those which support publishers could both be encouraged to target writers of minority ethnic origin.
- 5.4 It was reported that currently, some mainstream venues did not promote cultural diversity:

*'it's not part of the status quo activity and they will not take a date from a (minority ethnic) artist or musician because they just don't do that sort of thing and that's full stop.'*

- 5.5 Some participants were of the view that mainstream organisations face particular difficulties in supporting cultural diversity. For instance, they may not be able to enable international artists who come in to put on additional performances which could generate additional income and cover costs. It was felt that such organisations need to be supported in promoting cultural diversity, for example, through the provision of financial incentives, training, mentoring, expert support and audience development.
- 5.6 It was suggested that a critical element in the implementation of the CDP was audience development. Generally, there is a lack of market intelligence on the attendees of arts events. In order to develop audiences for minority ethnic art, it was important to identify barriers to access and various means of disseminating information about forthcoming events effectively. Mainstream organisations also needed to be supported by the Scottish Arts Council in organising arts events by, with and for minority ethnic communities, for example, in relation to familiarisation with risk management
- 5.7 It was suggested that focused support is needed for audience development. Edinburgh and Glasgow were identified as areas in which it would be easier to overcome the difficulties of developing audiences for arts associated with minority ethnic cultures. A feasibility study of what might be possible in areas which are less densely populated by minority ethnic communities was also required.

## **6 REVIEW OF POLICY**

- 6.1 Review of funding allocations was reported to be broadly related to an assessment of the outcome of the project against that specified in the proposal. This might include an assessment of the quality of provision and the financial outcome.
- 6.2 It was felt that there may be a need to provide some support in the form of information and advice in relation to Scottish Arts Council requirements for evaluation and monitoring purposes to minority ethnic organisations, which might not be familiar with these:

*‘Certainly, we have seen as a basis, issues of accountability...and evaluation and monitoring ... may be quite absent from anything that some organisations have ever done before. It can seem very onerous and strange although to us they seem perfectly normal and natural.’*

- 6.3 The reliability of monitoring data on minority ethnic participants was seen to be variable due to a number of reasons, including:
- Lack of shared understanding of common terminology such as minority ethnic groups
  - Difficulties in identifying the ethnic composition of audiences who attend a wide range of arts events, such as the Book Festival and the Film Festival
  - Difficulties in ethnically monitoring the composition of big groups of participants, such as members of an orchestra

- Possible reluctance of organisations or artists to be identified as belonging to a minority ethnic group
- Difficulties in stipulating the monitoring activities of core-funded organisations
- Lack of clarity as to whether the support of art which is a result of ‘fusion’ between art which is associated with minority ethnic cultures and mainstream art is related to the promotion of cultural diversity

6.4 However, despite the complexities of the process, ethnic monitoring was seen to be essential in terms of highlighting the success rate of various ethnic groups in accessing funding. It would also identify those art-forms which have succeeded in attracting applications related to the promotion of cultural diversity.

6.5 A number of quantitative and qualitative performance indicators were identified for assessing the success of the CDP:

- An increase in the number of minority ethnic applications
- An increase in funding allocated to minority ethnic artists or organisations
- Increased public awareness of minority ethnic art-forms, as measured, for example, through research or the extent of relevant coverage in the media
- A widespread awareness among the general public that art associated with minority ethnic communities and other art deserve to be equally valued
- Equal access to funding by all
- The maintenance and support of classical traditions in the minority ethnic communities

6.6 Several areas in which more information is needed in order to implement the CDP policy were identified. One area was related to basic fact-finding, including the size and composition of the minority ethnic population, and the pattern of minority ethnic artistic activity in Scotland, including the identification of artists.

6.7 Other areas in which information is perceived to be lacking include definitions and understanding of the arts, and artistic needs and aspirations in various minority ethnic communities:

*‘What constitutes art today? How do they want to go about that?’*

Such information would enable the Scottish Arts Council to identify the extent to which artistic needs and aspirations match existing Scottish Arts Council practice, and inform the extent to which this might be adapted to meet the needs and aspirations of minority ethnic communities:

*‘Let’s look at the mechanisms we have on the ground. Let’s look at how we bring them in.’*

6.8 There was also some awareness that differences in the artistic needs and interests might exist within minority ethnic communities, primarily between those who had migrated here and those who were born here. There was little knowledge of the extent to which both these groups identified with the culture and art of the majority and minority ethnic population.

- 6.9 Participants were also keen to identify the extent to which positive action and discrimination which might be taken to implement the CDP was lawful:

*'where do you stop – how do you really do it without getting into trouble'*

## **7 COMMUNICATION OF POLICY TO OTHER ORGANISATIONS**

- 7.1 It was felt that an audit of the means by which the Scottish Arts Council communicated with other organisations followed by the development of a media communication strategy might be useful.
- 7.2 It was suggested that it would be important to conduct outreach work and communicate the CDP to a wide variety of organisations, artists and potential audiences. This could take place through a wide range of reports, bulletins and magazines produced by the Scottish Arts Council and through the internet. It would also be useful to identify major stake-holders and employ targeted mailings.
- 7.3 It was felt that there were fewer channels in Scotland for communicating with the minority ethnic population than in England, and that advice was needed on the employment of better approaches.

## **8. LINKS WITH OTHER BODIES**

- 8.1 It was felt that the Scottish Arts Council would have to act in partnership with other key players to develop a strategic vision for the promotion of cultural diversity in the arts sector in Scotland.
- 8.2 There was a perception that links within the Scottish Arts Council in relation to arts associated with minority ethnic communities was established by the Strategic Development department.
- 8.3 Local authorities played a key role in providing local information to the Scottish Arts Council, although the role played differed among the authorities:

*'In some authorities it's just not an issue because they just don't have the critical mass of population ...but in the bigger centres, they're very well known issues'*

City of Edinburgh and Glasgow City Councils were seen to be important partners to the Scottish Arts Council, and provided specialist expertise to the Scottish Arts Council in the area of cultural diversity.

- 8.4 Links with minority ethnic organisations are mostly through local authorities, and through funding applications. There was some recognition of the benefits of establishing links for capacity-building, training and advocacy and some discussion about how more direct links might be developed by the Scottish Arts Council. Some concern was expressed over which members of staff would take responsibility for this, and the manageability of this task.

- 8.5 Other potential partners which were identified were the Social Inclusion Partnerships and the private sector. Both were seen as potentially playing a valuable role in this area, including providing increased financial support for the implementation of the CDP.

## **9 CONCLUSION**

- 9.1 The CDP policy was likely to raise expectations in relation to increased access to funding for minority ethnic arts provision. Sensitivity and care needed to be exercised in order to ensure that such expectations were not unrealistic and to minimise any disappointment or frustration resulting from unmet expectations.
- 9.2 It was felt that it was important to fully integrate the cultural diversity policy into the Scottish Arts Council's existing policies and practice, instead of viewing the policy as a separate and additional policy, in order to create a more culturally diverse arts sector in Scotland.
- 9.3 The vision for the future of minority ethnic arts in Scotland included equal access to funding for minority ethnic artists and organisations, increased provision for minority ethnic audiences, increased diversity and creativity in the arts in general and the creation of new forms which were distinctly Scottish:

*'One could hope that in five years' time there would be a group of agencies, organisations from those communities which were strong and able to talk to us and get money out of us and generally operate the same way as all the organisations that we fund do'*

*'What I sort of think is vive la difference. I hope we have a very vibrant exciting community in Scotland and everybody plays a part.'*

## KEY FINDINGS

1. The CDP is a clear statement that it is important for the Scottish Arts Council and other stakeholders to support cultural diversity in the arts.
2. It is important to review the Scottish Arts Council's funding allocation process to ensure equal access to funding for all.
3. It was perceived to be important for a mainstreaming approach to exist alongside a targeted approach in implementing the CDP.
4. Funded initiatives related to culturally diverse provision which were perceived to be successful had closely involved minority ethnic communities.
5. Perceptions as to what constituted 'success' varied, including the impact of the event and the quality of provision.
6. There was potential for the Scottish Arts Council to play a consciousness raising role and to support, encourage and create a framework for increased participation in the arts in general by minority ethnic communities.
7. There was a perception that some core-funded organisations currently did not sufficiently promote cultural diversity, and could be required to do so through conditions attached to the funding agreements.
8. Audience development was perceived to be a critical element in the successful implementation of the CDP.
9. The reliability of monitoring data on minority ethnic applicants was perceived to be variable.
10. Several quantitative and qualitative performance indicators were identified for assessing the success of the CDP including an increase in the number of minority ethnic applications, an increase in the funding allocated to minority ethnic organisations or individuals and increased awareness of art associated with minority ethnic communities in the general public.
11. Areas in which more information is required to inform the development of the CDP include increased knowledge of the pattern of artistic activity in minority ethnic communities, the experiences and aspirations of minority ethnic organisations and artists and the extent to which positive action can be taken.
12. Certain local authorities were seen to be important partners in implementing the CDP and it was also considered important to develop partnerships with other stakeholders.
13. The vision for the future included equal access to funding for minority ethnic artists and organisations and increased opportunities to benefit from culturally diverse provision by the majority as well as the minority ethnic population.



## **CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

This chapter draws together the main findings of the research and presents recommendations intended to inform policy and practice in the arts sector in Scotland. While the research was mainly concerned with Scotland's four largest minority ethnic communities, the implications of the study are relevant to the wider promotion of cultural diversity in the arts.

### **1. MAPPING AND PURPOSE OF ARTISTIC ACTIVITY**

- 1.1 Preceding chapters have identified an interest in participating in a range of artistic activity in the four communities which were the main concern of this study. This covered several art-forms including dance, music, literature, the visual arts, story-telling and photography.
- 1.2 One of the key issues was differences in the understanding of the boundaries of artistic activity, which might not be shared by funding bodies.
- 1.3 Much of the artistic activity promoted and organised by minority ethnic organisations was intended to preserve the classical traditions within each community and to maintain links with its cultural roots. Participation in artistic activity which drew on cultural identity was also seen to be an important means of maintaining psychological well-being, and counteracting negative stereotyping and racial discrimination in wider Scottish society.
- 1.4 The nature of artistic activity which takes place in minority ethnic organisations is strongly influenced by the interests of members of that organisation, the availability of trained professionals and teachers of a particular art-form and budgetary constraints.

### **2. BARRIERS TO PARTICIPATION AND ATTENDANCE**

- 2.1 One of the main factors which restrict minority ethnic communities ability to more fully participate in the arts was perceived to be a lack of recognition of the value of arts associated with minority ethnic communities among funding bodies and promoters of the arts, which led to a lack of financial support for these arts and to their marginalisation from mainstream arts provision. Participants felt that there was ignorance of the range and complexity of artistic activity which existed within each minority ethnic community.
- 2.2 Another major barrier to participation by minority ethnic communities in artistic activity was the lack of core-funding of most minority ethnic organisations with an interest in the arts, and a consequent reliance on volunteers. The generation of much artistic activity was reliant on successful funding applications for projects, for a time-limited period. Few organisations were able to maintain a sustained programme of artistic activity.
- 2.3 Other constraints which were related to accessing funding included lack of knowledge of funding sources, lack of understanding of funding criteria and

application procedures, lack of appropriate structures in minority ethnic organisations and mismatches between the criteria of funding bodies and artistic aspirations. Some participants reported a lack of personal contact with funding bodies prior to, and following the submission of funding applications.

- 2.4 Other factors which restricted participation were the lack of supportive infrastructure such as the provision of training, education and mentoring, and the lack of contact with other organisations, particularly mainstream arts organisations and arts development agencies. There were few opportunities for networking and learning from existing models of good practice.
- 2.5 Barriers which were related to attending the arts included several factors which were generally applicable to the mainstream population. These included costs of admission to events, proximity to venues, transport costs, timings of events and the need to provide child-care among parents of young children.
- 2.6 Barriers related to attending the arts which are applicable to the majority population but are heightened among those belonging to a minority ethnic community included:
  - The lack of relevance and previous exposure to certain art-forms, such as ballet and opera
  - Conservative views and discomfort with the use of 'swear' words and scenes of a sexual nature
  - Language differences which inhibited access to mainstream arts among some older people and which inhibited access to minority ethnic arts among some younger people

Certain cultural attitudes relating to the role of minority ethnic women may also influence their ability to access certain art-forms.

### **3. ASPIRATIONS FOR MINORITY ETHNIC ARTS**

- 3.1 Artistic aspirations of minority ethnic organisations were closely related to the promotion and preservation of art related to their culture and traditions.
- 3.2 One of the most commonly expressed aspirations for minority ethnic arts was increased recognition of its value, relevance and potentially rich contribution to the arts sector of multi-cultural Scotland among funding bodies, arts promoters, mainstream arts organisations and other key partners.
- 3.3 Several minority ethnic organisations and individuals were keen to more actively promote their artistic activities to audiences outside their particular community. This was related to an awareness of an interest in minority ethnic arts in the wider society and a desire to raise the profile and status of their work.
- 3.4 Other aspirations for minority ethnic arts were increased opportunities for sustained education and training within schools and elsewhere, and at different levels, from beginners to advanced, including professional training.

- 3.5 Minority ethnic artists interviewed for this study wished to be recognised primarily for their work and not as representatives of their communities.

#### **4 KEY ISSUES FOR ARTS DEVELOPMENT**

- 4.1 The understanding of what constitutes arts and artistic activity can vary; there is a need for dialogue between minority ethnic organisations and artists and funding bodies.
- 4.2 There is considerable scope for capacity building among the minority ethnic organisations in relation to support for sustained education and training in arts activities which are associated with minority ethnic culture and in skills related to arts administration.
- 4.3 A major gap was identified in the lack of appropriate venues for organising classes, workshops and rehearsals on an on-going basis.
- 4.4 While many mainstream organisations expressed an interest in promoting cultural diversity, and some had worked with a variety of culturally diverse organisations and individuals, they also recognised a tendency towards cautious programming, for economic reasons.
- 4.5 Some mainstream organisations felt that there was a lack of development work which could extend the audience base out with regular attendees and deeper into community groups, which would cross art-forms and venues.
- 4.6 Mainstream organisations beyond the Central Belt commented that the wider issues of geographical distance, lack of public transport and economic considerations were all factors which affected access to the arts in all communities outside metropolitan areas. However, there were additional factors such as the often small and dispersed nature of minority ethnic communities and other competing priorities such as preserving Gaelic and other indigenous languages, which tended to make these communities and their artistic aspirations invisible.
- 4.7 Difficulties reported by mainstream organisations in promoting cultural diversity included lack of knowledge with regard to quality and intention in unfamiliar non-Western art-forms and lack of resources.
- 4.8 Few mainstream organisations appeared to have a strategy, action plan or targets in relation to minority ethnic communities.
- 4.9 Existing skills and knowledge within mainstream organisations in relation to minority ethnic arts and communities have been largely self-taught, and organisational representatives were often not even aware of areas in which it might be beneficial to train.

## **5. STRATEGIC LINKS AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR COLLABORATIVE WORKING**

- 5.1 There are few strategic links between mainstream arts organisations and minority ethnic arts organisations, practitioners and communities. Few mainstream organisations had consulted with minority ethnic communities with regard to the content and design of their programmes or proactively sought to increase their audience range among the minority ethnic communities.
- 5.2 Links between local authorities and the Scottish Arts Council in relation to cultural diversity varied, from close collaboration at a number of different levels to no contact with the Scottish Arts Council in relation to this area. Established links took the form of strategic partnerships, joint working groups and a jointly-funded post. A key role played by certain local authorities was in relation to contribution of their knowledge of local communities and interests.
- 5.3 Links between minority ethnic organisations varied, with some reporting links through key individuals who took part in the activities of more than one organisation, and others reporting little or no contact with organisations in their own local area or other areas in Scotland.

## **6. RECOMMENDATIONS**

The recommendations in the remainder of this chapter are outlined in relation to:

- Development of the draft cultural diversity policy
- Developing a strategic approach to funding
- Capacity building
- The role of mainstream arts organisations
- Audience development
- Support for artists living in and visiting Scotland
- Representation on decision-making bodies
- Professional development and training
- Information provision

### **6.1 Development of draft cultural diversity policy**

In developing the policy, the Scottish Arts Council could consider:

- The importance of situating the policy within the current social and political agenda which has recognised and sought to address the existence of institutionalised racism in Scottish public institutions
- The revised framework now provided by the Race Relations Act 1976 as amended by the RRRRA, and the inclusion of the Scottish Arts Council as a public body by an Order under section 71, reinforces the need to mainstream support for arts by, with and for minority ethnic communities, within the various functions of the Scottish Arts Council, as well as other public agencies providing public support, notably local authorities. In essence, this will require the setting of objectives and their monitoring and review.

Accountability by way of regular reporting on a regular basis should also be considered as part of the developing response to the general and specific duties placed on public bodies.

## **6.2 Developing a strategic approach to funding**

In developing a strategic approach to funding art by, with and for minority ethnic communities, the Scottish Arts Council and other funding bodies could consider:

- Reviewing funding criteria and conditions for applications
- The implications of the current heavy reliance on volunteers in minority ethnic organisations
- The need for capacity building in minority ethnic organisations at various stages of development
- The need to more actively promote funding opportunities to minority ethnic communities
- The importance of providing increased access to information about sources of funding and funding mechanisms to minority ethnic organisations and artists
- Investigating approaches to supporting applicants from minority ethnic organisations
- The development of appropriate performance indicators and review process

## **6.3 Capacity building**

The Scottish Arts Council and other funding bodies could consider the development of a strategy for sustained and long-term development of minority ethnic arts which is:

- Underpinned by adequate resources
- Informed by knowledge of the full range of artistic activity in minority ethnic communities
- Supported through the provision of core-funding for selected minority ethnic organisations
- Encouraged through funding mechanisms which allow for the participation of those of differing levels of ability and interest, from beginning to advanced and professional
- Supported through the provision of networking opportunities and the development of mentoring schemes

- Supported by the provision of appropriate premises for minority ethnic artistic activity on a regular and ongoing basis
- Developed through benchmarking with English models and learning from good and bad practice

#### **6.4 Role of mainstream arts organisations**

The Scottish Arts Council and other funding bodies could consider how mainstream arts organisations can be supported in implementing the cultural diversity policy through:

- Consulting with minority ethnic communities in the content and design of their programmes
- Planning joint initiatives with minority ethnic artists and organisations
- Promoting minority ethnic arts within existing programmes of artistic activity
- The setting up of appropriate funding arrangements, including funding criteria
- The extent to which support through effective risk management systems can be made available

#### **6.5 Audience development**

Funding bodies could consider means of supporting audience development to increase the audience base for arts with, by and for minority ethnic people through the development of a strategy which:

- Is underpinned by research which identifies potential barriers and factors which would encourage attendance, including cultural tastes and interests
- Supports mainstream and minority ethnic arts organisations by centrally coordinating information about current and forthcoming arts activities and events

#### **6.6 Support for artists living in and visiting Scotland**

The Scottish Arts Council, funding bodies and mainstream arts organisations could consider supporting minority ethnic artists living in Scotland through:

- Inclusion of their work in mainstream programmes and venues
- Enhancing opportunities for collaborating with other artists
- Funding mechanisms which include targeted forms of support, allowing individual artists choice in how they situate themselves and their work
- The provision of opportunities for networking

- The provision of increased access to information, advice and support
- Discussions with appropriate partners on a coordinated approach towards maximising the benefits to be obtained by visiting artists.

#### **6.7 Representation on decision-making bodies**

Funding bodies could consider greater representation of suitably qualified minority ethnic people on decision-making bodies to:

- Ensure that the composition of these bodies reflects a multi-cultural population
- Contribute to informed decision-making
- Facilitate the application of equal opportunities policies

#### **6.8 Professional development and training**

The Scottish Arts Council and other funding bodies could consider:

- The implications of the RRAA for training and development in the arts sector and in their own practice
- The development of effective measures for ethnic monitoring of funding mechanisms
- The development of appropriate performance indicators

#### **6.9 Information Provision**

The Scottish Arts Council could consider the provision of specialised information provision for minority ethnic organisations which covers:

- The range of funding sources which are available for minority ethnic arts
- Advice on complying with application procedures and funding criteria

## APPENDIX 1: TOPIC GUIDE FOR FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS

### Introduction

Brief explanation regard the purpose of the research and what will be done to the data

Reassure participants of anonymity

Ask participants to introduce themselves

### 1 Attitudes towards the arts

- i) What do you do in your spare time? ('ice-breaker')
- ii) What 'Arts'/cultural activities are you interested in?
- iii) Why? Why not?
- iv) What sort of arts activities do you particularly associate with the African (or Chinese etc.) community
- v) What kinds of arts/cultural activities do you think older people/first generation African (or Chinese etc) are interested in?
- vi) What kinds of arts/cultural activities do you think younger/second generation African (or Chinese etc) are interested in?
- vii) Are you interested in mainstream arts activities such as theatre/recitals/concerts/dance/exhibitions/literature/visual arts/crafts exhibitions?
- viii) Why/why not (prompts: lack of relevance, costs etc.)

### 2 Access to the arts

- i) Do you get the opportunity to attend African (Chinese etc) Arts/cultural activities/events?
- ii) What/when/where/with whom?/why?/why not?  
– *features relating to venues, time, expense, relevance*
- iii) Do you get the opportunity to attend mainstream arts activities such as theatre/recitals/concerts/dance/exhibitions/literature/visual arts/crafts exhibitions?
- iv) What/when/where/with whom?/why?/why not?  
– *features relating to venues, time, expense, relevance*
- v) What do you hope to get out of attending these activities/events?  
– *features relating to venues, time, expense, relevance*
- vi) What do you think of the provision of/opportunities of/opportunities for 'arts' and 'cultural' activities/events in the area you live? What sort of activities/events would you like to be available for you to attend?
- vii) How do you find out about cultural activities/events that are going on?
- viii) Can you think of better ways for you to hear/get to know about events or activities that were taking place?

### 3. Participation in the arts

- i) Do you get the opportunity to take part in African (Chinese etc.) arts/cultural activities/events?  
*Prompts – do you make/create anything/paint/sing/dance/write/act/recite?*
- ii) Do you get the opportunity to take part in mainstream arts/cultural activities/events such as theatre/recitals/concerts/dance/exhibitions/literature/visual arts/crafts exhibitions?
- ii) What do you get from taking part in these activities/events?



Prompts –entertainment, education, retain link with cultural roots

- iii) Would you like the opportunity to do (or take part in) any of these things?
- iv) Do you know where/how you might find out about taking part in any of these things?
- v) Do you know where/how you might be able to apply for funds which could help you to do these things?
- vi) Do you think it is important for minority ethnic people to be represented on decision-making bodies which fund and promote arts activities? If so, why?

**APPENDIX 2: INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR MINORITY ETHNIC ORGANISATIONS**

**INTERVIEWEE DETAILS**

Interviewee name + status/position 1: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewee name + status/position 2: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewee name + status/position 3: \_\_\_\_\_

Organisation/Project: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_  
Fax: \_\_\_\_\_  
Email: \_\_\_\_\_  
Web site: \_\_\_\_\_

Date/Time: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_

Duration of interview: \_\_\_\_\_  
Additional notes:

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Introduction

- Background to the research project
- The role interviewee's contribution will play in research process
- Explain how interview material will be used
- Confirm anonymity

## Background

1. Could you please outline the core aims and objectives of your organisation?  
*- What is its prime purpose?*
2. What kind of arts activities has your organisation been involved in the last three years? (including programmes, projects, workshops or sessions)  
*- What has been the nature of this involvement? (e.g. have you sponsored, supported, arranged, promoted or funded arts activities)*
3. What kind of arts activities would your organisation be interested in developing in the future?
4. How do you decide on the content of the projects, programmes or workshops offered?  
*- What criteria do you use when deciding on direction & focus?*  
*- What is the curriculum intended to achieve?*

## Funding

5. Which organisations do you currently receive funding from?
6.
  - a) Have you ever received funding from the Scottish Arts Council or your local council?
  - b) If so what kind of funding have you received (capital funding, core-funding, project funding, for one year etc.) How much funding have you received? For what purpose?
  - c) If not, do you know why?
7. What are the key issues or difficulties you experience in relation to fundraising for black and ethnic minorities work? (i.e. difficulty in meeting conditions for funding, staff time, lack of information, short-term funding)?  
*- Are there any funding issues & needs which are unique to black and ethnic minorities organisations, and if so what are these?*
8. Can you offer any practical suggestions that would help to relieve fundraising difficulties?  
*- What could funding agencies (the Scottish Arts Council, local authorities, trusts, etc.) do to more effectively assist fundraising processes?*

### **Minority ethnic art forms**

9. Although difficult to do, could you please explain:  
a) What you think is the definition of an arts activity?  
b) Where you draw the boundary between art and non-art in your work?
10. Do you think the Scottish Arts Council adequately caters for the specific needs of minority ethnic art forms,  
  
*- If not, in what ways is this provision inadequate?*

### **Participants and non-participants**

11. If possible, would you please give me an idea of the people who currently take part in your initiatives (i.e. numbers of people, ethnicity, first generation or second generation, age, gender, employment status, post-code, etc.)?  
  
*- Is there a good balance of art forms available for participants of different ages and cultural tastes?*
- In particular, is there a range of activities for both first and second generation Pakistanis (or Chinese etc), that is, those Pakistanis (or Chinese etc) who migrated to this country as well as those who were born in this country?  
  
*- Are there particular issues/difficulties around providing activities for both the first and second generation?*
12. How do participants find out about, and get involved with, your work (i.e. advertising, word of mouth, how systematic are information systems & what inefficiencies exist)?
13. Do you experience any difficulties in relation to attracting participants, and if so what?  
  
*- How could these difficulties be relieved?*
14. Could you tell me some of the reasons why you think people take part in your initiatives?  
  
*- What are they looking for?*  
*- What do they gain from their involvement?*
15. What kind of activities & opportunities do participants move onto as a result of being involved with your organisation?
16. What opportunities or resources are you not able to offer participants, and what would you need to help you do this?
17. How do you publicise your arts activities to attract potential audiences?  
  
*- Are there any particular issues or difficulties around this?*

18. Are there any individuals or groups of people that you do not currently work with but would like to?
19. What do you think are the main factors that prevent greater involvement in the arts generally, and in minority ethnic arts specifically?
20. What kind of resources and assistance would you need to make your work more accessible for those who do not currently attend?

### **Links, collaborations and good practice**

21. Which organisations or individuals do you collaborate with regularly, and in what capacity (i.e. share resources, coordinate projects with, run joint classes)?
22. Who would you like to work with more regularly, and what prevents this (i.e. lack of support/coordination, isolation)?
23. Have you ever had any contact with any mainstream arts organisations, if so, in what capacity, and if not, why not?
24. What could be done to help encourage greater collaboration with:
  - *Other minority ethnic organisations/individuals?*
  - *Mainstream arts organisations?*
  - *Arts in the communities providers?*
25. Could you please tell me which organisations you see as models of good practice, and why?
  - *Are these based in Scotland or abroad?*
  - *Are you aware of models of good practice nationally or internationally?*

### **Training needs**

26. Could you please explain what kind of qualifications and experience your staff (regular staff as well as sessional workers) have in relation to the arts generally, and of working with minority ethnic people in the arts specifically?
27. What skills and training gaps do you think currently exist for working with minority ethnic arts, and what is needed to improve this skills base generally?
  - *What could the Scottish Arts Council and local councils do to assist this?*

### **The Scottish Arts Council**

28. Could you please tell me what kind of assistance you think the Scottish Arts Council provides generally, and for black and minority arts work specifically?
29. Besides giving more money, what do you think the Scottish Arts Council could do to most effectively assist your work, and develop minority ethnic arts provision (information, funding processes, training, good practice sharing, lobbying, networking, etc.)?

### **Local authorities**

30. What role do you think local councils could/should play in developing minority ethnic arts provision?

### **Other agencies/organisations**

31. Do you know of other agencies or organisations in your area which have promoted, organised or staged arts activities for minority ethnic communities?
- Are you aware of any (other) small, informal groups whose activities might take place in the temple/mosque/gurduwara for example?*
32. If so, which are these agencies/organisations? What kind of activities have they promoted?

### **Conclusion**

33. What gaps do you think currently exist in terms of minority ethnic arts provision, what could be done to improve this, and by whom?
34. Do you think it is important for minority ethnic communities to be represented on decision-making bodies related to the promotion and funding of the arts? If so, why?
35. If possible, could you please explain what your ideal vision is for the development of black and minority arts in Scotland?

**Thank you very much for your time**

**The comments you have made will be treated with the strictest confidentiality and your anonymity will be respected at all times**

### APPENDIX 3: INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR ARTISTS OF MINORITY ETHNIC ORIGIN

#### Interviewee Details

Interviewee name + status/position 1: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewee name + status/position 2: \_\_\_\_\_

Organisation/Project: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_  
Fax: \_\_\_\_\_  
Email: \_\_\_\_\_  
Web site: \_\_\_\_\_

Date/Time: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_

Type of interview: face to face \_\_\_\_  
telephone \_\_\_\_

Duration of interview:

Location:

How recorded: notes \_\_\_\_  
tape \_\_\_\_

Additional notes:

---

---

---

---

---

## Introduction

- Background to the research project
- The role interviewee's contribution will play in research process
- Confirm anonymity

## Background and current provision

1. Could you please tell me how you came to be an artist and what education, and training you have had for this?

*- How adequate do you think this training has been for your current professional requirements?*

2. Could you please explain a bit about your own artwork (i.e. art forms, contexts, formats)?

3. How do you see yourself as an artist in relation to your cultural and ethnic identity?

*- Does identification with any particular cultures/ethnic group manifest itself within your work?*

4. What are you trying to achieve as an artist (purpose, motivation, ambitions)?

5. What status do you think minority ethnic art has within the arts sector generally, and how do you position yourself within this?

## Links with other organisations

6. Do you work with black-led or minority ethnic organisations? If so, which organisations are these, and what is the nature of your artistic involvement with these organisations? (facilitator of workshops, teacher/trainer etc.)

What has been your experience of working with black-led arts organisations or groups?

If not, why not?

*- What, if any, restrictions prevent you working more widely/collaboratively?*

7. Do you ever work with mainstream arts organisations? If so, which organisations are these, and what is the nature of your artistic involvement with these organisations?

What has been your experience of working with the mainstream arts organisations?

If not, why not?



- *What, if any, restrictions prevent you working more widely/collaboratively?*

8. What role do you think the Scottish Arts Council should play in improving collaboration between minority ethnic arts provision and other arts providers?

- *How appropriate are their approaches?*

- *Are there gaps in their knowledge, experience, and resources?*

### **Working as an artist**

9. Please highlight the kinds of professional opportunities which currently exist for artists such as yourself?

- *How do you hear about and secure work?*

- *How do you manage to earn a living from your work?*

10. What factors, if any, restrict you in achieving your goals as an artist (i.e. what difficulties do you experience)?

11. What access do you have to studio, rehearsal, or working space, and how satisfactory are resources for artists generally (i.e. material needs)?

- *What do you think could be done about this?*

12. Do you think the professional experiences of those working in minority ethnic arts differ from those of others, and if so, how?

13. In what ways do you think funding agencies position you and your work, and how appropriate do you think their support mechanisms are

- *Are you primarily positioned as a target category (as a black/minority ethnic artist) or are you primarily positioned in relation to the intrinsic value of your art work?*

- *How appropriate do you think this is?*

### **Professional development**

14. Who do you consider to be your professional peer group, and what opportunities do you have to interact with them (i.e. share ideas, get feedback)?

15. What opportunities exist for further professional development, and what could the Scottish Arts Council provide which you would find useful in this regard?

### **Sessional and tutoring work**

16. Do you do any teaching or arts work with black and minority ethnic groups in a community or education setting?  
  
*- If so, please explain what this involves?*
17. What are the key issues or difficulties you experience in relation to working within these contexts?
18. Can you offer any practical suggestions for the Scottish Arts Council which would help to relieve these problems (i.e. especially in relation to National Lottery provision)?

### **Minority ethnic arts provision**

19. What do you think is the purpose of black and minority arts activity specifically, and does this differ in any way from the function of art generally?
20. What do you think of current black and minority arts services in your local area?  
  
*- What works well?*  
*- What problems and difficulties are there?*
21. What do you think could be done (besides more money) to improve arts provision for diverse communities in Scotland?

### **The Scottish Arts Council**

22. What kind of contact or links have you had with the Scottish Arts Council, and can you comment on the quality of service they provide for black and minority ethnic artists?
23. Are you informed about Scottish Arts Council funding generally, and in relation to minority ethnic arts specifically?  
  
*- Have you ever approached the Scottish Arts Council for funding and what was your experience of this?*
24. Besides providing more resources, what role do you think the Scottish Arts Council could/should play in developing minority ethnic arts?

### **Arts audiences**

25. If possible, would you please give me an idea of the kinds of people which currently take an interest in black and minority ethnic arts, and what attracts them to this?
  - a) who do you consider to be your audience?
  - b) what do you think participants/audiences are looking for?
  - c) what do you think they gain from their involvement?
26. What are the main factors which prevent greater involvement in attending minority ethnic arts, and how could the sector better serve a

wider section of the population?

- *What resources/assistance is needed to make this work more inclusive?*

**Conclusion**

27. If possible, could you please outline what your ideal vision is for the development of black and minority arts in Scotland?
28. What do you think are the main challenges facing black and minority ethnic arts provision in the future, and how do you think the Scottish Arts Council cultural diversity strategy should anticipate and address these?

**Thank you very much for your time**

**The comments you have made will be treated with the strictest confidentiality and your anonymity will be respected at all times**

## APPENDIX 4: INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR LOCAL AUTHORITY ARTS OFFICERS

### Interviewee Details

Interviewee name + status/position 1: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewee name + status/position 2: \_\_\_\_\_

Organisation/Project: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_  
Fax: \_\_\_\_\_  
Email: \_\_\_\_\_  
Web site: \_\_\_\_\_

Date/Time: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_

Type of interview: face to face \_\_\_\_\_  
telephone \_\_\_\_\_

Duration of interview: \_\_\_\_\_

Location: \_\_\_\_\_

How recorded: notes \_\_\_\_\_  
tape \_\_\_\_\_

Additional notes:

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## **Introduction**

- Background to the research project
- The role interviewee's contribution will play in research process
- Confirm anonymity

## **Background and current provision**

1. Could you please tell me what your own roles and responsibilities are within the Council?
2. What services does your department provide in relation to:
  - *The arts generally?*
  - *Black and minority arts specifically?*
3. How many members of staff do you have, and what roles do they fulfil?
  - *Do staff work with specific target communities or geographical areas? (i.e. any identifiable minority ethnic arts workers)?*
4. Would you be able to give me an idea of the types of minority ethnic arts projects, workshops or programmes undertaken in your area?
  - *Do you have any information about these projects which I can take away?*

## **Funding**

5. Could you please explain what funding schemes you currently offer?
  - a) What percentage of your grants are allocated to black and minority ethnic arts activities?
  - b) Do you have any grants targeted specifically at black and minority ethnic arts work?
  - c) How is provision for minority ethnic arts activities monitored?
6. How are your grants advertised (i.e. languages, distribution, target communities)?
7. What kind of support is offered to potential minority ethnic funding applicants?
8. What specific difficulties, if any, do minority ethnic individuals have in applying for grants?
  - *How could local authorities and the Scottish Arts Council offer more effective assistance in relation to applying for funds?*

## **Minority ethnic arts provision**

9. In your opinion, what are the strengths and weaknesses of current black and minority ethnic arts provision in your area (i.e. unsatisfied needs, gaps in resources)?

### **Minority ethnic arts participation**

10. What measures do you take to identify the full range of artistic activity within black and ethnic minority backgrounds?
11. What key difficulties do minority ethnic arts clients have in relation to:
  - a) Interacting with local authorities
  - b) Interacting with the Scottish Arts Council
12. What kind of assistance do you think minority ethnic artists need to develop their work (i.e. from local authorities and the Scottish Arts Council)?

### **Minority ethnic audiences/participants**

13. Do you have any links with schools, community centres, and voluntary organisations which have minority ethnic attendees?
  - *If so, in what capacity?*
  - *If not, why not?*
14. Could you please outline any key difficulties you experience in relation to working with diverse minority ethnic communities?
15. What do you think are the main factors that prevent greater involvement in the arts from such communities?
16. How do you think local authorities and the Scottish Arts Council can improve access for non-participants from minority communities?

### **Links with black and ethnic minority agencies**

17. What kind of links, if any, do you have with minority ethnic groups and organisations (i.e. arts and non-arts)?
18.
  - a) What do you think closer collaboration with these organisations would help to achieve (i.e. need formal networks)?
  - b) How could these relationships be better facilitated by local authorities and the Scottish Arts Council?

### **Strategic contexts**

19. Are you aware of any existing Scottish Arts Council or local authority policy/strategic guidance in relation to minority ethnic arts work?
  - *If so, what?*
20. Please explain how, or whether, you are developing strategies to better coordinate services for black and ethnic minority arts/communities?

*- Are minority interests explicitly integrated as part of overall social inclusion strategies?*

21. In what ways do you think the Scottish Arts Council and local authority priorities and practices differ, and/or complement each other, in relation to working with minority ethnic communities?

*- What are the strengths and weaknesses in the strategic approaches adopted by the Scottish Arts Council and local authorities?*

### **Working links with the Scottish Arts Council**

22. What kind of links do you currently have with the Scottish Arts Council?
23. Do you think the Scottish Arts Council adequately caters for the specific needs of black and minority ethnic art forms in practical terms, and if not, how could this provision be improved?
24. Would you welcome increased practical and/or strategic level collaboration with the Scottish Arts Council (i.e. useful synergies, information sharing, policy action/integration, training)?
- How would you approach this practically?*
25. What do you think the Scottish Arts Council could do to most effectively assist your work in relation to minority ethnic arts provision (i.e. what do you need from them)?
26. In turn, how could councils provide more support, advice, and assistance to the Scottish Arts Council in their development of black and minority arts provision?

### **Professional development**

27. Have you (or other staff) received any specific training for working with black and minority ethnic communities in arts provision?
- What assistance/help could the Scottish Arts Council and local authorities provide to improve this skills base?*
28. What, if any, opportunities do you have to network, exchange ideas, and share models of good practice with other arts professionals in this area of arts provision?

### **Conclusion**

29. If possible, could you please outline what your ideal vision is for the development of black and minority arts in Scotland?

30. What do you think are the main challenges facing minority ethnic arts provision in the future?
31. Would you like to add any further comments?

**Thank you very much for your time**

**The comments you have made will be treated with the strictest confidentiality and your anonymity will be respected at all times**



## APPENDIX 5: INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK FOR MAINSTREAM ARTS ORGANISATIONS

### Interviewee Details

Interviewee name + status/position 1: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewee name + status/position 2: \_\_\_\_\_

Organisation/Project: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_  
Fax: \_\_\_\_\_  
Email: \_\_\_\_\_  
Web site: \_\_\_\_\_

Date/Time: \_\_\_\_\_  
Interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_

Type of interview: face to face \_\_\_\_\_  
telephone \_\_\_\_\_

Duration of interview:

Location:

How recorded: notes \_\_\_\_\_  
tape \_\_\_\_\_

Additional notes:

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### **Introduction**

- Background to the research project
- The role interviewee's contribution will play in research process
- Confirm anonymity

### **Background and current provision**

1. Could you please outline the core aims and objectives of your organisation?  
  
- *What is its prime purpose?*
2. Do you think there is a good balance of available arts resources in your area?  
  
- *If so, in what way?*  
- *if not, what are the gaps and needs?*

### **Audiences**

3. If possible, would you please give me an idea of the kinds of people which currently take an interest in the arts, and what attracts them to this?  
  
- *Who do you consider to be your audience?*  
- *How do participants get involved (i.e. how is information disseminated)?*
4. Are there any individuals or groups of people which you do not currently work with but would like to?  
  
- *What barriers prevent you from working with them?*
5. What are the main factors which prevent greater involvement in the arts generally, and from minority ethnic communities in particular?  
- *Do you have any difficulties attracting participants and if so, explain?*
6. What kinds of resources and assistance would you need to make your work more accessible to a broader cross-section of the population?

### **Minority ethnic arts provision**

7. In your opinion, what are the strengths and weaknesses of current black and minority ethnic arts provision in your area (i.e. unsatisfied needs, gaps in resources)?  
  
- *What problems and difficulties are there?*

### **Links with other organisations**

8. Which other arts projects or organisations do you work with?
9. Do you ever work with any minority ethnic arts organisations or artists, and if not, why not?  
  
- *What, if any, restrictions prevent you working more widely/collaboratively?*
10. Please highlight the kinds of opportunities which currently exist for you to

work with culturally diverse artists and communities?

11. What status do you think minority ethnic art has within the arts sector generally?
12. What role do you think the Scottish Arts Council should play in improving collaboration between minority ethnic arts providers and arts organisations like yourselves?

#### **Working within diverse cultural contexts**

13. What, if any, has been your experience of working on multi-cultural arts projects (i.e. types of projects undertaken)?
14. What key issues and difficulties have you experienced (i.e. fund raising, different working practices/expectations, difficulties in attracting participants etc.)?
15. Can you offer any practical suggestions which would help relieve these problems?
16. How do you identify minority ethnic artists?
  - *What kind of assistance do you think they need to develop and promote their work within the arts sector generally?*

#### **Training and professional development**

17. Could you please explain what kind of training and experience you and other staff have in relation to working with diverse ethnic communities?
  - *Are any gaps in your training or knowledge about such contexts?*
  - *What training could the Scottish Arts Council provide which would be useful to you?*

#### **Strategic contexts**

18. What existing Scottish Arts Council or local authority policy/strategic guidance are you aware of in relation to cultural diversity and the arts?
19. Does your organisation have any kind of strategy, action plan, or targets in place for conducting work with minority ethnic artists and communities?
  - *If so, please elaborate*
  - *if not, why not?*

#### **Links with the Scottish Arts Council**

20. What kind of contact or links have you had with the Scottish Arts Council in relation to conducting work with diverse ethnic communities/artists, and can you comment on the support they provide in this respect?
21. How informed are you about Scottish Arts Council funding, information, and support in relation to minority ethnic arts work?

*- Have you ever approached the Scottish Arts Council for funding in this regard and what was your experience of this?*

22. Besides more money, what do you think the Scottish Arts Council could do to most effectively assist your work in relation to minority ethnic arts provision (i.e. what do you need from them, if training is required, what kind of training)?
23. In your opinion, what could be done to improve arts provision generally for culturally diverse communities in Scotland, and by whom?

**Conclusion**

24. If possible, could you please outline your ideal vision for the development of black and minority arts in Scotland?
25. Do you have any final suggestions for what you think the Scottish Arts Council's black and minority ethnic arts strategy should contain?

**Thank you very much for your time**

**The comments you have made will be treated with the strictest confidentiality and your anonymity will be respected at all times**

## **APPENDIX 7: TOPIC GUIDE FOR FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH SCOTTISH ARTS COUNCIL STAFF AND COMMITTEES**

### **Introduction**

- Participants introduce themselves
- Researchers introduce context and purpose of research and focus group and confirm anonymity

### **Part 1: General views about the draft cultural diversity policy and mainstreaming**

1. What are the strengths and weaknesses of the existing draft policy?
2. How do existing Scottish Arts Council structures and activities promote or inhibit arts provision by for and with black and minority ethnic communities?
  - *Are there likely to be contradictions between the cultural diversity policy and other existing Scottish Arts Council policies?*
  - *Are there competing priorities? How high a priority is cultural diversity within the Scottish Arts Council?*
3. Are there any examples of successful initiatives intended to promote cultural diversity?
  - *What are the factors which contributed to their success?*
4. Are there any examples of initiatives which were less than successful/unsatisfactory?
  - *What are the factors which contributed to this?*
5. What do you think art form staff/committee members need to know to respond appropriately to the cultural diversity policy?
6. What can be done to encourage Scottish Arts Council core-funded organisations to promote cultural diversity?
7. What is the role of the Black and Minority Arts Development Officer?
  - *How can his role be supported by staff/board/committees?*

### **Part 2: Role of the Scottish Arts Council as advocate**

8. What role can the Scottish Arts Council play in advocating on behalf of minority ethnic communities in the arts?

### **Part 3: Role of the Scottish Arts Council as funding body**

9. a) In your view, what are the strengths of current minority ethnic arts provision in your sector?  
  
b) What are the weaknesses of current minority ethnic arts provision in your sector (unsatisfied needs, gaps in resources etc)?
10. Are there any criteria in each art-form by which applications are judged which might disadvantage minority ethnic applicants?
11. How accessible are the various schemes to minority ethnic applicants?
  - *What measures are taken to publicise the existence of these schemes to minority ethnic communities?(languages, distribution, target communities)*
  - *Might some of these schemes limit participation among black and minority applicants?*
12. What are the main factors that prevent greater involvement in the arts by minority ethnic communities as audiences and practitioners?
13. What support is currently provided to black and minority applicants? What support should be provided to them?

### **Part 4: Role of the Scottish Arts Council in providing a supportive infrastructure for cultural diversity**

14. What role does the Scottish Arts Council play in improving the skills base for funders and administrators which is related to arts provision for, by and with minority ethnic communities?
15. How can the Scottish Arts Council ensure that it identifies the full range of arts practice which is specific to minority ethnic communities?
16. What role does the Scottish Arts Council play in assisting local minority ethnic artists across the various art forms? (training and development, providing fellowships/ networking opportunities and improving the skills base)

### **Part 5: Review of policy**

17. How is funding which is specifically targeted to black and minority arts provision currently monitored within the Scottish Arts Council?
  - *What kind of information is currently available on projects intended to promote cultural diversity?*
  - *Is there a breakdown by ethnic group, art form, geographical area etc?*

- *What kind of information would be useful?*

18. What would be appropriate indicators against which the success of the policy can be assessed?

### **Part 6 Communication of policy**

19. In which ways might you publicise the existence of the finalised cultural diversity policy to staff/core-funded bodies and other agencies in your sector?

### **Part 7 Links with other bodies**

20. As far as you are aware, in what ways do the Scottish Arts Council and local authorities priorities differ or complement each other in relation to working with minority ethnic communities?

- *Would you welcome increased strategic or practical level collaboration with local authorities? (policy action/integration, information sharing, training)*

- *How could local authorities most effectively assist the Scottish Arts Council in black and minority arts provision?*

- *In turn, how could the Scottish Arts Council assist local authorities?*

21. What links does the Scottish Arts Council have with minority ethnic agencies?

- *What do you think closer collaboration would help to achieve?*

- *How can better relationships be facilitated by the Scottish Arts Council?*

### **Conclusion**

22. If possible to describe, what would your ideal vision for the development of minority ethnic arts in Scotland?

23. What do you think are the two main priorities to be considered when finalising the cultural diversity policy?

- *Are there concerns about resources?*

## APPENDIX 7: LETTER TO LOCAL AUTHORITIES

**Date**

**Dear**

### **Black and Minority Ethnic Arts in Scotland**

The Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit is conducting research funded by the Scottish Arts Council to inform the development of the Scottish Arts Council's Cultural Diversity Policy and improve its provision for Black and ethnic minority people in Scotland.

An element of the research involves mapping Arts activities of Black and minority ethnic groups and individuals in Scotland. To facilitate this, we require records covering the last three year period (1998-2001) of funding awarded by Local Government Authorities to **either** mainstream organisations **or** black and minority ethnic organisations and individuals for the purpose of increasing access and participation in the Arts by black and minority ethnic communities. It would be helpful if information could be provided regarding:

- the organisation or individual to whom funding was allocated
- the amount of funding which was allocated
- the purpose for which it was funded
- the type of funding which was allocated (capital funding, core-funding, contracts, grants, service level agreements etc)
- the period of time it was intended to cover

If funding was not allocated for the above purpose, it would also be useful to document this.

We are working to a very tight time-schedule set for us by the Scottish Arts Council and it would be extremely helpful if you could respond to us by the 10<sup>th</sup> of September 2001.

If you have any queries, please do not hesitate to contact Karen Qureshi (0131-221 6187) or Gina Netto (0131-221 6269).

Yours sincerely

Karen Qureshi  
Research Associate