



ARTISTIC EVALUATION

This evaluation is intended to represent an objective aesthetic judgement. **Specialist advisors and officers should avoid making judgements based on their own personal tastes and preferences wherever possible.**

Artist/Company: C.I.C.T/Theatre des Bouffes du Nord

Venue: Tramway

Title of Event: 11 and 12

Type of Event: Performance

Date of Visit: Thursday 1st April 2010

Overall Rating: **SATISFACTORY**

After an eagerly awaited return of Peter Brook to Tramway, personally I found *11 and 12* deeply disappointing. Although the show looked beautiful and was well performed, there was not enough dramatic tension to sustain my interest for 90 minutes. Although Tramway 1 and Peter Brook have a long relationship dating back to *Mahabarata*, the cavernous space of Tramway 1 was not ideally suited for this production. My view is that *11 and 12* would have benefited from being performed in a more intimate space, e.g. Tramway 4.

Name: Wendy Niblock

Date: 5th May 2010

Scottish Arts Council Officer

This report has been commissioned by the Scottish Arts Council to evaluate the artistic quality of the production named above. It has been prepared by either a specialist Advisor, or an officer of the Scottish Arts Council, as indicated on the form. The report will be circulated to the organisation which produced the work and to the management of the venue, if the venue is core funded by the Scottish Arts Council.

The report will form evidence for the Artistic Leadership and Public Engagement sections of the Quality Framework and be taken into account in assessing the work of the producing company in relation to future applications for funding to the Scottish Arts Council. It may also be used by the Joint Board to report on the overall performance of its funded organisations.

Evaluators should enter their rating under each section, explaining briefly their reason for the rating with reference to their comments under each section. Ratings should be given in accordance with the following:

Very poor- standard falls well below what is acceptable.

Poor - not well conceived and executed

Satisfactory

Good - well conceived and executed

Very Good – well conceived and executed to a very good standard

Excellent – Inspiring and executed to an exceptionally high standard

1. Artistic Assessment

Please evaluate the artistic quality of the event, with particular reference to the strengths and weaknesses of the following:

Artform	Criteria	Rating	Comments and key reasons for rating
All	Vision and imagination of work <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of ideas • if you have seen other work of this artist(s)/ company before, please comment on any relevant comparisons 	Good	<p>I have seen other pieces by Peter Brook and have always considered him to be a master and a visionary in his work. Although the story and the creative ideas were strong and it looked absolutely beautiful, I considered it to be quite a dull production and quickly lost engagement with the piece.</p> <p>The piece felt very contemplative and needed a lot of concentration. However, being on the upper level of Tramway 1, it was difficult to hear, which was very frustrating for myself and my companions as we all struggled to follow the story.</p>
All (if relevant)	Curatorial/ programming vision/ selection <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How does it fit within the artistic vision of the organisation? • If the event is part of a Festival, please say how it contributes to the overall programme. 	Good	<p>Tramway and Peter Brook have enjoyed a 22 year relationship since the venue first opened as a performance space with his acclaimed production of <i>Mahabharata</i>. Staging <i>11 and 12</i> at Tramway seemed an obvious choice as part of its tour.</p> <p>Tramway's programme is an eclectic mix of theatre, dance and visual arts. In my opinion, <i>11 and 12</i> was an appropriate piece for the venue to include as part of its Spring season.</p>

Artform	Criteria	Rating	Comments and key reasons for rating
All	<p>Success of event against stated aims of project and/or performance</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How does it relate to information contained in the programme, the website or other printed material? How well did it communicate the artistic themes? How did the event originate eg from the exhibiting/ producing organisation, from the artist or from commission? <p>Education events – see ¹below for definition</p>	Satisfactory	<p>Tramway's brochure gave an interesting description of the piece. Given the relevance to current world politics and the fact that it was directed by Peter Brook who has inspired many of today's theatre practitioners, there was an air of excitement about this production in the lead up to its Tramway run.</p> <p>In his director's note, Brook states that '<i>this adaptation brings to the stage a unique narrative in which religion; politics, understanding and prejudice constantly intervene. It is tragic and mercilessly comic, full of sharp insights into the struggles of the past, which resonate ever more strongly today.</i></p> <p>Given that Tramway is based in Pollokshields – a multi cultural area – <i>11 and 12</i> had the potential to be of interest to a wide and culturally diverse audience. However, on the night I was there, it appeared to be a regular Tramway audience.</p> <p>As to understanding the piece, I am no further forward with my understanding of the politics surrounding Africa and this horrendous event.</p>
All	<p>Performers/tutors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> What is the expertise of the performers? Where performers are amateur, please reflect this in your comments. How successfully did the performer(s) communicate with and engage the audience? In your view, was an artist as a tutor key to the success of the workshop? 	Excellent	<p>The whole cast was strong and were all great performers. I have seen Makram J Khoury perform in <i>Jidariyya</i> a couple of years ago at the Edinburgh International Festival and, both times, have been captivated by his performance.</p>
Dance, Theatre	<p>Choreography/Use of choreography</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Was the work original? How was the space used? How many dancers were there and how were they used? How long was the piece? 	N/A	N/A
Theatre	<p>Script</p> <p>Please comment on this for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> new work second productions classics where the original has been substantially changed 	Satisfactory	<p>I feel as if I am not able to comment on the script as I struggled to hear what was being said on the night as I was so far back.</p> <p>Tramway's brochure mentions that <i>11 and 12</i> is based on Brook's play <i>Tieron Bokar</i>,</p>

¹ Education is a bridge between artform excellence and increased access and participation, and it is people centred. Providing opportunities for learning and progressing in an artform or using an artform to address other, non-artistic, outcomes are equally valid; in either case a high quality strategic approach is required in order to benefit the participants and the organisation. Delivery can be through workshops, post/pre-show discussions, outreach work, etc aimed at any age group.

Artform	Criteria	Rating	Comments and key reasons for rating
			<p>performed in French and played to critical acclaim in 2005 in Warwick.</p> <p>It is my view they should have performed <i>11 and 12</i> in French and had English supertitles. This would have greatly helped the audience in terms of their comprehension.</p> <p>The group that I was with experienced the same problems with audibility.</p>
Theatre, Dance	Direction <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Was the work well interpreted? • Was it well cast? • Was it well presented? 	Satisfactory	<p>Although it was well cast and presented to a high standard, I found the piece ultimately dull and extremely disappointing.</p> <p>It felt lost in Tramway 1 as there were problems hearing it from the upper level. The piece felt contemplative and intimate and needed your undivided attention. I'm afraid it lost mine and that of my seven companions!</p>
Dance, Theatre	Use of music <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Did the music/ sound used enhance the production? • Is it live or recorded? 	Excellent	Composed and performed by Toshi Tsuchitori, I found the music inspirational and thought it highly complemented the performance.
Dance, Theatre	Design <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How were the costumes, set and lighting? • How did it work in the venue? • Was it technically proficient? (eg lighting and sound cues, etc). 	Good	<p>Set design was very simple and extremely effective. No credit for design was mentioned in the programme.</p> <p>Lighting design by Philippe Vialatte was atmospheric and complemented the naturalistic feel of the piece.</p> <p>Costumes by Helene Patarot were appropriate for the production.</p>
All	Quality of Public Engagement Performing Arts/Education - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Was the production/event targeted at a particular audience? • Was the production /event appropriate for the audience/participants? • Were you/ engaged/inspired? • Did the audience/ participants appear to be engaged/inspired? • What was their response? • Approximately how many people were there? • Did there appear to be a broad mix of people – age, cultural diversity or disabled? • Are BSL/captioned/audio described performances offered as part of the run/tour/? If so how many? • What activities or supporting materials were available to enhance the experience of the event eg workshops, artist's talks, discussion groups 	Satisfactory	<p>The build up to the performance started a few months prior to the performance. I read preview pieces in the national press which evoked a great deal of excitement within the Scottish theatre community.</p> <p>Given the nature of the piece, it is my view that <i>11 and 12</i> had a wide appeal, including a culturally diverse audience. As mentioned, the night I was there it appeared to be a regular Tramway audience.</p> <p>As far as I can make out, no signed or audio described performances were offered during its run at Tramway.</p> <p>There were eight in my party and none of us felt inspired by the performance. Subsequently I have spoken to other people who saw the performance and the general consensus was that it was very disappointing and lacked any dramatic tension (despite the fact, the potential was there, given the theme of the piece).</p>

Artform	Criteria	Rating	Comments and key reasons for rating
	<p>programmes, on line info?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Were these targeted at specific age groups? <p>Education/learning events: In addition, please provide comments on the following (if appropriate):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How was it taught/led eg one to one, group, child centred? What was the composition of the participant group – age range, gender mix? Is it strategically linked to the curriculum or national policy areas e.g. Early Years, Community Learning & Development What learning/skills development took place? What was the quality of the art produced by the participants? Did the workshop tutor have a teaching plan for the session and/or project? How were participants recruited? Did participants' views and choices help inform the structure and content of the project? <p>Crafts/Visual Arts Use of equipment, space and overall layout/hang?</p>		

2. Management of Event

Please evaluate the way the event was presented/organised by the organisation and the venue, with reference to the checklist below, including additional comments/observations. Please try to view the venue and the services, and interpretative material as though you had never visited it before eg if you did not know the venue's location, how easy would it be to find your way there, and to find your way around once you had arrived?

Criteria	Comment
<p>Location and suitability of the venue for the event</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Is it easy to find? Is it on a main transport route? Are the spaces clean? What were the sight lines like? How big was it? 	<p>Tramway is situated on Glasgow's southside and is on several bus routes. The venue is also right next to Pollokshields East train station.</p> <p>Although Peter Brook has a strong and long affiliation with Tramway, it is my view that Tramway 1 was not ideal for this performance. Personally, I thought it would have worked better in Tramway 4, which would have provided a more intimate setting.</p> <p>Tramway 1 accommodates around 600. On the night I saw the performance, the auditorium was approximately 75% full. Although there were no problems with sightlines, I was seated in the upper level and had difficulty hearing the performance.</p>
<p>Information/ interpretive material at venue–</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Are there programmes, posters and displays about the event? 	<p>The theatre had a good front of house display of posters and fliers. There was also a poster outside of the venue advertising the show.</p>

Criteria	Comment																
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Is there information on the venue's website? 	Tramway's website was very informative as was the programme for <i>11 and 12</i> .																
<p>Publicity/ pre-publicity –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> What leaflets, posters, websites, did you see the event listed in? What publicity materials are produced? Is it easy to understand? Where can you get the information? Is there Acknowledgement of Scottish Arts Council Funding ²? <p>Please be alert to the publicity available prior to your visit to the event and comment on the company/organisation's website.</p>	<p><i>11 and 12</i> was in general listings of Scottish dailies and nationals.</p> <p>The Tramway brochure also contained a double page spread. The venue is also very good at keeping in contact through Facebook.</p> <p>SAC accreditation was on the inside front cover of the programme and also on Tramway's homepage.</p>																
Ease of booking and payment	Booked in person at Tramway Box Office.																
<p>Timing of the event</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Did the start and finish time seem to be appropriate for the audience? Was the length appropriate? 	The performance started at 7.30pm and lasted 90 minutes with no interval. This seemed appropriate for the production.																
<p>Signage and signposting</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Is the entrance clearly marked? Is there clear internal directional signage? Is there Braille signage or signage for audio loops? 	Signage is clear with Tramway, although I am not aware of any braille signage. There is an infrared system fitted within Tramway 1 that is used for audio description and to amplify sound.																
<p>Access and provision for disabled people</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please insert yes/no in the boxes to reflect what you notice about the venue/event <p>Please add in any additional comments below the table</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How many BSL/captioned/audio described performances are there at the venue? 	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Yes/No</th> <th></th> <th>Yes/No</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>BSL interpretation</td> <td>NO</td> <td>Audio description of performances</td> <td>NO</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Captioning</td> <td>NO</td> <td>Lift/ramp</td> <td>YES</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Accessible toilets</td> <td>YES</td> <td>Accessible marketing materials eg website or alternative formats eg large print, Plain English</td> <td>YES by calling the box office.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Yes/No		Yes/No	BSL interpretation	NO	Audio description of performances	NO	Captioning	NO	Lift/ramp	YES	Accessible toilets	YES	Accessible marketing materials eg website or alternative formats eg large print, Plain English	YES by calling the box office.
	Yes/No		Yes/No														
BSL interpretation	NO	Audio description of performances	NO														
Captioning	NO	Lift/ramp	YES														
Accessible toilets	YES	Accessible marketing materials eg website or alternative formats eg large print, Plain English	YES by calling the box office.														
<p>Customer service</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How was the quality and efficiency of staff (e.g. box office, front of house, bar and/or catering) If possible, comment on how 	I have always found Tramway Box Office and Front of House staff to be friendly and efficient. This was the case both on the night and at the time of booking the tickets.																

² In press releases, at launches, on all published materials (including leaflets, brochures, programmes, posters, company's website, notices display, exhibition materials, websites and advertising, recordings, publications, video, broadcasts, computer programmes etc.) Where the event is publicised in the programme brochure of another organisation (eg venue, gallery, etc) then SAC acknowledgement should appear against the particular programme entry for this event.

Criteria	Comment
responsive they were to the needs of disabled customers?	

3. Organisation's Comments (optional)

This is the organisation's opportunity to respond to points raised within this assessment. Please do not feel obliged to fill this section in. In the spirit of the Quality Framework, we would ask that any comments are self-evaluating, providing an insight as to why, if there is, a major disagreement of response between the organisation and the evaluation, in a constructive way.

This will not alter the rating given by the assessment, but will allow the organisation the opportunity to give their opinion/feedback. The Scottish Arts Council reserves the right to edit comments if they are deemed to be libellous or defamatory.

As the Scottish Arts Council implements the Quality Framework internally, we intend to publish artistic evaluations on organisations that we support regularly on our website. The final artistic evaluation, including the organisation's response will be published on a quarterly basis on our website.

Please keep your response to max 500 words. If we do not hear from you in 15 days, we will assume that you do not want to respond.